# Table of Contents

**Editor’s Notes and Acknowledgements** .......................................................... 3

**Viewpoint (Cover Art) Descriptive Text**  
Kaylin Hill, Stacey Roten, Siyu Wang, and Jimmy Wilder ........................................ 4

**International Adoption, Dyadic Belonging, and the Liminal Self: The Case of a Korean American Adoptee’s Return to South Korea**  
Diedra Cates ........................................................................................................... 6

**A Review of Teachers’ Perceptions and Training Regarding School Bullying**  
Abby K. Gorsek and Melissa M. Cunningham .............................................................. 13

**Lipstick and Granola: Perceptions of Feminism**  
Mycah L. Harrold ................................................................................................... 18

**An Examination of the First Years: Novice ESOL Teachers’ Experiences with Loneliness and Stress**  
Randal K. Johnson, Mycah L. Harrold, Daisy J. Cochran, Debi Brannan Ph.D., and Tasha Bleistein ................................................................. 26

**Predicting the Cy Young Award Winner**  
Stephen Ockerman and Matthew Nabity .................................................................. 34

"It'll Work Out:" Older Mothers' and Adult Daughters' Perspectives on Future Plans  
Amy D. Ringering, Jennifer Rice, Nickie Sickles, Erin Wilson, and Margaret M. Manoogian Ph.D. ................................................................................................. 42

**The Effects of Target Valence on Thought Suppression Efficacy**  
Tesalee K. Sensibaugh ............................................................................................. 53
Editor’s Notes and Acknowledgements

Camila Gabaldón Western Oregon University

This year has been a whirlwind of activity on the Western Oregon University campus, yet the our students and faculty found time to produce, review, and edit an issue of PURE Insights that has, yet again, impressed me with the quality of work it contains. Amazingly, this is our third year! In this issue, we have pieces ranging from an international journey to help discover one’s identity, to pieces focusing on contemporary issues, such as families dealing with aging parents and societal perceptions of feminism, to a mathematical model for predicting award outcomes in baseball. This issue also includes an article that went through our very first cross-college editorial process, including faculty from both the College of Education and the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences.

I’m very pleased to be introducing this issue. With several major projects going on this spring, I was reminded that, when deadlines collide at WOU, there is no shortage of generous individuals who volunteer to jump in to help out. This issue wouldn’t have happened without the hard work and dedication of our reviewers, section editors, and, of course, the authors. This year it really wouldn’t have happened if my colleagues in the library hadn’t stepped in and done some copy editing in the final days. Thank you, Stewart Baker, Elizabeth Brookbank, Janeanne Rockwell-Kincanon, and Tracy Scharn!

Finally, as I am finishing my notes, I want to again acknowledge the hard work of the authors, both those whose work was included in this issue and those that were not. It takes a lot of courage to put your work out there, even with the possibility that it won’t be selected and I am extremely grateful that you all took that risk. As I was contemplating how to finish these notes when I awoke this morning, I heard the news of the death of a great poet and her words seem fitting to acknowledge my appreciation:

“I believe that the most important single thing, beyond discipline and creativity is daring to dare.” — Maya Angelou
Viewpoint

Kaylyn Hill Western Oregon University
Stacey Roten Western Oregon University
Siyu Wang Western Oregon University
Jimmy Wilder Western Oregon University
Faculty Sponsor: Jennifer Bracy

This art was created as part of a class zine project. The concept/direction for the zine was generated by a group of students, then selected by the class for use. This cover was a collaborative interpretation of that concept conceived of by Kaylyn Hill, Stacey Roten, Siyu Wang, and Jimmy Wilder. The design was executed by Kaylyn Hill.

The problem the class addressed was:

Imagine that hundreds of designers used their skills and creativity to respond to the most important and newsworthy issues of today. This collection will be the focus of a blog, a book, an exhibition, a documentary... (it doesn’t really matter what format or media it might be, ultimately). How would this kind of graphic statement—this power used for good, for awareness, for protest, etc.—be expressed? What would you title it? What visual treatment might be applied to or accompany that title?

The "Viewpoint #nofilter" concept reflects the act of looking closely and critically at world events and responding with honesty. Therefore, there are many perspectives of the world shown but within a form that also resembles an eye, a target, a print registration mark, etc.

The art was modified for the cover of PURE Insights, but is presented here in the original form.

Keywords: #nofilter, viewpoint, perspective, media, design, zines
International Adoption, Dyadic Belonging, and the Liminal Self: The Case of a Korean American Adoptee’s Return to South Korea

Diedra Cates, Department of Anthropology, Western Oregon University

This paper examines the social location and conflicting identities of Korean American adoptees often referred to as KADs. Utilizing participant observation and interviews conducted in South Korea, the author discusses how Confucian ideology, which stresses consanguineal relations, affects and shapes the ways in which the Korean government and society view KADs in the context of international adoption. The author also draws upon personal field experiences in South Korea to highlight the expectations placed upon KADs in a Korean context, and how this can result in identity confusion and reconfiguration upon their return to a country that has been historically ashamed of them.

*Keywords*: International adoption, dyadic belonging, liminality, KAD, South Korea, rite of passage

**Introduction**

I was two months into my South Korean trip in the fall of 2011, when the splendors of living in a foreign country started to dissipate. I longed to be around English speakers, to eat a cheeseburger with fries, and ultimately, to feel comfortable in my own skin. Up until that point, everything was a new experience and had been exhilarating, but the constant change had become less exciting and more stressful. I wanted to do something or go somewhere more familiar, and I decided there was no better place to go than the International District in Seoul. The other volunteers from Ilsan Town, also Korean-American adoptees (KADs), and I dressed in our best clothing and headed off to see the play, "The Importance of Being Earnest."

The crew and the actors were from England, and we were ecstatic about being around people to whom we could relate and understand, and vice versa. Moreover, we were in a district that many natives did not venture into, and found ourselves to be the only Koreans in the room. For the first time, I felt completely comfortable with my surroundings while abroad, but something still felt off. The other volunteers and I conferred with one another and came to the realization that while we believed we fit comfortably into this situation, we were actually being seen as the “other.”

My field experience captured above was a seminal moment in South Korea. While being “othered” is not foreign to KADs whether it is in an American or Korean context, it served as a reminder to me and my fellow volunteers that we live in a liminal social space: we may feel American in the U.S., but other people may not perceive us as such and question our ethnic identity. While abroad, Korean natives perceived us as fellow Koreans, but we felt completely estranged. Thus, independent of location, we are continuously questioned and expected to fill different roles: in America, we are assumed to be foreigners, and in South Korea, we are assumed to be natives—we are always betwixt and between.

In this paper, I explore how Confucian ideology, which stresses consanguineal relations, has affected the Korean government and society’s perceptions of international adoption and KAD identity. I illustrate how Confucian values have fashioned expectations for KADs, which are implicitly and explicitly placed upon them through government and public discourse. I argue that the conflict between how KADs identify themselves based upon notions of identity in an American context, and how they are expected to be in a Korean context results in identity confusion.

To better understand this dilemma, it is essential to first address the inception of international adoption in South Korea and how historical problems necessitated the need for adoption. This historical knowledge will aid in a better understanding of the current situation of international adoption in the country and demonstrate how Confucian ideology has created differing notions of identity and unachievable expectations for KADs in a Korean context. I further explain the variance between the American and South Korean notions of identity, and how identity formation is unique to this population by drawing on my own positionality as a KAD to help orient the reader. The phenomenon that I speak of is not only informed by history and traditional ideology, but also by the reality of KADs whose stories I analyze in this paper from an anthropological perspective.
The Unspoken History of Adoption in South Korea

Since the Joseon Dynasty (circa 1392), South Korea has employed Confucianism not so much as a religion, but as a political tool to create social order and hierarchy. Even though Christianity is the most widely practiced religion in South Korea, Confucian values remain influential. These values do not condone adoption of those who are not of the same bloodline: filial piety is one of the greatest Confucian virtues, which elicits the respect that a child or person should show based upon hierarchial tiers. First, one must honor thy country, then thy parents. Inherently, Confucian ideology produces an analogous and physical distance between tiers in the name of respect and stresses the emphasis on nationalism and the preservation of tradition.

Immediately following the Korean War and the Armistice Agreement signed in 1953, South Korea emerged from political turmoil with an abundance of “GI babies” (U.S. Department of State). These were children who were conceived by Korean women and Western soldiers. In the 1950s and 1960s, the first wave of orphans were mixed-race and born to poor factory workers. An insufficient amount of resources and space for the influx of orphans combined with the Confucian family ideology in Korea led to a rejection of adoptions all together that were not between blood relatives (Volkman 2005: 58).

As a result of the widely held Confucian views on adoption, international adoptions became the best option for South Korean-born children in need of homes. From 1954 onward, the adoption of children from South Korea to the Western hemisphere became so popular that over 150,000 South Korean children were adopted within fifty years by Americans and Europeans (Kim 2007: 498). In 1955, Harry and Bertha Holt became pioneers of transnational adoption after they adopted eight children from South Korea. They then established Holt International Children’s Services (HICS) in 1956 (Volkman 2005: 56). Since the 1960s, rapid industrialization in South Korea has allowed the country to turn itself into a modernized nation. Such rapid progress has also come with major social problems, such as caring for the needs of vulnerable populations (e.g., the mentally and physically handicapped and orphans).

Historically, South Korea was hesitant to welcome back KADs or even acknowledge their existence until the 1990s when they realized that they could no longer hide the foreign adoptions that had been tagged by Korean media as a national shame (Volkman 2005: 187). Thus, the government discourse changed to be pro-KADs, and efforts were made to handle the adoption issue in a more positive way.

Identity Formation

The Merriam-Webster dictionary defines identity as “sameness of essential or generic character in different instances.” While this definition is a representation in comprehensive English, having similar “generic character” does not even scratch the surface of the variability that words and the concepts associated with them carry: “knowledges have cultural foundations on the basis of which they are formed” (Kondo 1990: 28). Therefore, while South Korean and American cultures each have particular words to represent the concept of identity, the formation of the meanings produced can be different.

A KAD’s identity formation process may be complicated by two different types of identity attributed to adoptees from transracial families: there is one’s ethnic identity and their personal identity, which do not always coexist. For instance, as a KAD, my ethnic identity can be defined as belonging to South Koreans, a people who presumably share a common heritage and phenotype. My personal identity is a response to my ethnic identity and has been independent of my supposed allegiance to my ethnic group. In the U.S. many recognize me as Korean first, and it seemed clear that I was perceived as a native Korean while abroad. The reality is that I do not possess Korean cultural knowledge, nor was I raised in the country, yet, I am assumed to represent that ethnic group. I have attempted to form my own personal identity in spite of my ethnicity within an American context. However, I soon learned that, in a Korean context, the two could not remain mutually exclusive.

Two additional factors can complicate a KAD’s identity formation before they even embark upon their journey to their birth country. In the United States, Asians are perpetually seen as foreigners, as well as “honorary whites” (i.e., unlike white ethnics, non-white ethnics cannot assimilate completely even over generations due to physical differences) (Shiao and Tuan 2008: 1025). Additionally, growing up in a transracial family can create identity confusion since many adoptees relate to the dominant adopted culture, rather than to their heritage. In a study conducted at the University of Oregon on adult KADs, the researchers found that American society characterizes KADs as “Asian” and not “American” (Shiao and Tuan 2008: 1025). These findings reflect the dyadic existence of KADs whereby they are seen as foreigners and “honorary whites” simultaneously (Shiao and Tuan 2008: 1025).

Other studies have also found that adoptees are most likely to identify with their adoptive family’s ethnic group, rather than their own ethnic group (Soon Huh and Reid 2000: 76). When reflecting upon my own experiences and the experiences of other KAD volunteers while abroad, I found this to be generally true among transracial families.
For example, phenotypic confusion—why do I look Asian when I feel Caucasian like my parents?—is an example of how one’s ethnic identity can diverge from their personal identity. The level of identification varies depending on how culturally diverse a family decides to be. Many adoptive parents may not see race or ethnicity as a barrier and they may deemphasize the phenotypic differences (Soon Huh and Reid 2000: 75), which can lead to a complete rejection of a KAD’s birth heritage or apprehension about being a part of it. Personal identity formation for KADs can be difficult to reconcile in an American context, and many hope to address this issue upon their return to their birth country. However, my field experience will illustrate how this confusion is often not eradicated, but instead augmented, upon return to the birth country.

Government Discourse: Re-education, Preservation, and Economic Prosperity

There are multiple reasons why South Korea would want to finally shed light on their relationship with adoption and would want adoptees to return. These include economic and political ties, preservation of Korean tradition, and pride. These reasons do not seem completely altruistic, however, and the conflict of purpose has clearly contributed to the complication of the KAD’s experience as they search for a sense of belonging while abroad. South Korea states that it wants to encourage returning adoptee assimilation through re-education programs, but the government’s actions seem to show more concern about economic and political growth.

As South Korea emerged from the devastation of the Korean-American War, President Seung-Man Lee was highly supportive of the idea of foreign adoption law. As Lee explicitly stated, he wanted to solve the problem of interracial orphans by finding non-Korean homes for bi-racial children (cited in Lee 2005: 124). Given South Korea’s conservatism and adherence to Confucianism, keeping a child that was not fully Korean was seen by Korean society as ludicrous, which emphasizes the prevailing notion that adoption was an embarrassment for all involved. The ultimate goal was to preserve filial, rather than fictive relationships (i.e., relationships that are not based upon blood), and also to deter people from contaminating the Korean blood with that of foreigners.

When evaluating the evolution of the South Korean social welfare system, it is apparent that the government has revamped the structure and the goals numerous times as the country continues to develop. As in the 1950s, there are currently many private institutions (e.g., Holt Children’s Services) and voluntary service groups in South Korea that run social services, such as orphanages, homes for the disabled, and adoption agencies. From the 1960s to the 1970s, the South Korean government chose to invest in military expansion and economic growth rather than in social welfare programs. Consequently, many programs could not be implemented, which put more stress on foreign aid and civil organizations to provide voluntary services for orphans, the poor, and the elderly. It was not until the late 1970s that the country began to construct proper social welfare policy (Lee 2005: 195). In theory, this decreased the need for private organizations in South Korea. However, many of the child welfare centers that were built in response to policy change were turned into places for mentally or physically handicapped people, which only increased the need for international adoption.

In 2010, South Korea was ranked 28th out of the 29 OECD (Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development) countries based upon how much of its gross domestic product (GDP) was spent on social welfare. At only 10.95%, the nation was ranked just above Mexico (Korea Times). As history has illustrated, South Korea reacts to economic downturn by opening up the international adoption gates, preferring to hide current social problems rather than to publicly admit their faults.

Another contributing factor to this continual denial is that the South Korean government has historically viewed adoption from a Confucian perspective. Hence, the topic of adoption remained an embarrassing “secret” until the 1988 Olympics when they were internationally criticized for exporting their “greatest natural resource,” their children (Volkman 2005: 57). The result was that by the 1990s, the South Korean government’s policies and discourse on adoption had changed drastically towards a positive foreign perspective—but for whose gain?

A second turning point in Korean government discourse was when the president of South Korea, Kim Dae Jung, gave a formal apology to four hundred Korean-born adoptees at a ceremony in Washington, DC in 1999. He not only openly addressed the public stigma of adoption in South Korea for the first time, but he also embraced adoptees as “Overseas Koreans” who would bridge the gap “between the country of birth and the present country of citizenship” (Volkman 2005: 63). While being the “bridge” between one’s birth country and adoptive country seems like a beautiful gesture, the drive behind this reconnection seems highly based upon global gain: through KADS, South Korea would create more foreign ties and receive foreign dollars by way of returning adoptees.

Despite public education campaigns and public policy implementation in South Korea, native Koreans generally still pity adoptees for their lack of Korean kin ties. This feeling of pity suggests that there is still a disconnect between the sentiments the government hopes to project and the perspective of the public. Ultimately, the previous examples illustrate that the change in government...
Cates | International Adoption, Dyadic Belonging, and the Liminal Self

perspective on adoption and adoptees was not necessarily influenced by a new social perspective. Rather, change occurred due to the fact that South Korea could benefit from newfound connections with foreign Korean adoptees and their respective countries, and thereby allow the government to perhaps save face. As a country based upon the Confucian value of respect for thy nation, changes in government discourse could cleanse the nation’s name of past embarrassment.

The Korean government also attempted to implement more policies and programs that directly influence returning KADs and the adoption community. It is debatable whether or not they are positive or negative. For example, the Adoption Quota Policy states that only a certain amount of foreign adoptions can occur within a year and by certain agencies (Lee 2005: 198). As a prominent organization, Holt Children’s Services (HCS) can conduct a significant amount of adoptions. However, HCS must carefully track how many adoptions are being processed considering that the government continues to decrease the number of children allowed to be sent abroad by 3-5% each year (interview with Molly Holt: September, 2011). This places a tremendous amount of pressure on agencies to create innovative ways to deal with the number of orphans already waiting to be adopted while juggling the influx of new orphans daily.

Although South Korea’s plan is to get rid of the need for foreign adoption, the plan has yet to succeed due to the lack of interest in domestic adoption. In response, the government continues to campaign for domestic adoption by offering tax incentives and family benefits. This demonstrates the lack of agreement between public and government discourse and the continuous adherence to Confucian ideology.

From the 1990s onward, globalization was in full force and differing perspectives were expressed: Frances Cairncross, a British economist and journalist, stated that “the communications revolution is profoundly democratic and liberating, leveling the imbalance between large and small, rich and poor; the death of distance... should be welcomed and enjoyed” (cited in Volkman 2005: 185). The idea is that the fluidity of national borders increases multiculturalism and makes us all a part of a “global village.” Despite these romantic notions, globalization seems to have only hardened South Korean national identity, the complete opposite of what Cairncross has envisioned. As an example, in her article titled *Three-week Re-education to Koreaness*, Elise Preblin a Ph.D in Korean anthropology, recalled when globalization was announced as an “unstoppable economic new order that would diminish national identities and culture” (2008: 324). In the 1990s, the president at the time, Kim Young Sam, took this to heart and saw globalization as only an economic opportunity, “We cannot be global citizens without a good understanding of our own culture and tradition,” meaning, that for whatever foreign influences were placed upon South Korea, they would contest it with equal force in the form of nationalism (Preblin 2008: 325).

To ensure the survival of South Korean traditions and values, the Korean government created the Overseas Korean Foundation (OKF) with two goals in mind: to keep the Korean authentic identity intact and to re-educate returning KADs (Preblin 2008: 325). Preblin believes that while these programs have been created in the hopes of combating the negative aspects of globalization from inside the country, they also serve to attract KADs back to the country. In this sense, international adoptees are seen as Koreans of the diaspora (i.e., the dispersion of Koreans from their homeland) and need re-education to discover their “true identity” (2008: 323).

Despite the level of knowledge that returning adoptees had about their adoption history or birth country, Preblin believed that cultural programs, especially OKF, depended less on shared belief and agreement and more on the appropriate orchestration and action of the program. This illustrates that the focus is on aesthetically, but not actually, showing one’s “Koreaness,” which creates an illusory sense of belonging. Programs like OKF are founded upon the notion of South Korean culturalism, which is based upon the idea that adoptees have physical and genetic predisposition to be and behave like native Koreans (Preblin 2008: 326). The adoptee’s identity is directly confronted during these programs and the adoptee is compelled to demonstrate their “Koreaness,” therefore, clearly demonstrating a misunderstanding between how an adoptee perceives their own identity and how they are expected to act within a Korean context.

Reflecting upon my own experiences as well as those of fellow KAD volunteers, programs designed for returning adoptees often create a more defined separation between native Koreans and themselves: “these rituals have a valid purpose although they lead not to integration but to separation: defining the diaspora continues to rely on defining what is outside the national territory” (Preblin 2008: 323). For example, a fellow returning KAD had participated in a cultural program with the goal of re-education and stated that the program was full of traditional activities, such as a tea ceremony, a mock wedding, a Hangul and language class, and visits to the Folk Village, the Blue House, and various palaces. The program was designed to introduce adoptees to the Korean culture and a diploma of sorts was presented at the completion of the program. The fact that these traditional events are not found in everyday Korean life serves to forge a deeper connection between adoptees’ and their heritage. It is as if the government is setting a
precondition, which is that to be truly Korean and formally accepted, one must experience things that are truly unique to South Korea. These re-education programs are, therefore, not created with the KAD solely in mind, but with the intention of teaching what it means to be “Korean.”

The F4 Visa is another way that South Korea has tried to decrease the need for adoption while creating an illusory sense of acceptance for returning adoptees. The “Act on Entry/Exit and Legal Status of Overseas Koreans” was passed in September 1999 and put into effect that December. “It grants Overseas Korean Nationals, who have established residency in a foreign country, and Foreign National Koreans who once had Korean citizenship, virtually all the same legal rights as Korean nationals. Overseas adult adoptees are among those who can benefit from this act,” according to the guidelines provided by the Seoul Immigration Office and prepared by Dae-Won Wenger and Nicole Sheppard of Global Overseas Adoptees’ Link (G.O.A.’L). However, this act was not established with the intent of including Korean adoptees. Adoptees were only included after G.O.A.’L lobbied for the inclusion of the group.\(^1\) This act has been publicized as a way for adoptees to truly become native; however, the F4 Visa only lasts for two years, which can give an adoptee a false sense of identity and belonging in the meantime.

Upon closer inspection, I have discovered that many of my own experiences resonate with what Preblin observed. I did feel like many of the events that I participated in stressed action over the emotional connection. For example, I often went to different types of traditional ceremonies while abroad, and, obviously, they were conducted in the Korean language. I never knew what they were saying, but I could figure out the context and mimic what everyone else was doing by watching their facial expressions and gestures. The fact that I was present was good enough for all involved, and they felt that I was actually participating in Korean culture, despite the fact that I would usually sit there frustrated because I never got the subtle jokes or the sentimental comments.

I felt the need to pretend to be a part of the whole and that it was not appropriate to show my “Americaness.” While in Korea, I was expected to be Korean and to be proud of my heritage no matter how superficial my connection. I do not deny that I made connections with wonderful native Koreans, but the experience only confirmed the differences between my birthplace and my sense of self. Rather than re-education, the experiences created a frustrating situation in which certain things were expected of me and I was not able to meet those expectations.

While these cultural programs along with the F4 Visa seem like genuine gestures from the Korean government, it is difficult to see their actions as entirely altruistic. As a KAD, I do not see these new policies and cultural programs as long term solutions in regards to addressing the real problem. They are merely a peace offering that aligns with the nation’s intention to show that they had not completely overlooked their “forgotten children.” These programs portray an air of showmanship, and it seems they are truly concerned with saving face and adhering to Confucianism as South Korea continues to modernize. The Adoption Quota Policy seems like a move in a positive direction, towards a future where adoption is unnecessary. The idea, however, has been romanticized since the inception of international adoption and it is not a logical answer in view of the current public discourse. Society is not ready to overlook Confucian ideology. We should question what Korean policies and programs say about the country’s modernization, and how the current government perspective on returning adoptees and international adoption affect an adoptee’s sense of belonging upon their return.

In sum, the elusiveness of the South Korean Foreign Adoption Policy illustrates the tension between the state’s adherence to tradition and its desire for modernity. The result is that KADs are stuck in the middle; we are not native and we are not foreigners. This creates a complex situation where KADs must attempt to find their own sense of belonging while trying to adhere to their personal identity molded by their respective culture and, simultaneously, meet certain Korean expectations.

**My Own Sense of Belonging in South Korea**

Throughout my trip, I went from being someone who questioned their identity and struggled with their dyadic existence in the context of American culture, to finally, being someone who now better understands the complexity of their situation and does not feel compelled to decide between being Korean or American.

In Victor Turner’s essay, “Betwixt and Between: The Liminal Period in *Rites de Passage,*” he states that the rite of passage is present in all societies and consists of transitions between states or what he calls physical, emotional, or mental conditions (1964: 46). Noting the works of Arnold van Gennep, the first anthropologist to study the transitional stages that take place in a person’s life, Turner conceptualizes the rite of passage as being

---

\(^1\) G.O.A.’L is a non-profit organization and a NGO consisting of overseas Korean adoptees and native Koreans working together to locate birth families and experience Korean life.
composed of three phases: separation, transformation, and reincorporation. The first phase, separation, signifies the detachment of the individual or group from their previous cultural conditions (e.g., status or location) (Turner 1964: 46-47). During the transformation phase, the individual goes through a state of ambiguity with “few or none of the attributes of the past or coming state” (Turner 1964: 47). With the third phase, or reincorporation, the passage is completed, and the individual has returned to a “stable state.” The expectations and obligations have changed, however, and are clearly defined, and the individual is “expected to behave in accordance with certain customary norms and ethical standards” (Turner 1964:47).

In light of both van Gennep’s and Turner’s work, I perceive my own experience abroad as a rite of passage. In the first stage, I was forced into a different culture with different notions of identity and kinship, and I came face-to-face with my dyadic existence. I went from having to convince Americans that I was more American rather than Korean, to convincing Koreans that I was more Korean and not American. In the second stage, I not only had to learn how to be more Korean, but I also had to learn how to be a Korean adoptee within a Confucian system of thinking. In the United States, adoption is perceived positively. In South Korea, however, adoption continues to be viewed negatively, whether it is domestic or international. Thus, my return went directly against many Confucian notions: I was born out of wedlock to a single mother, therefore I do not have a Korean family to call my own, and I was adopted outside of the country. Consequently, I felt compelled to illustrate my “Koreaness,” just as I feel obligated to show my “Americaness” while at home. It was clear that a KAD can never be Korean enough, only too American, and a KAD’s notion of identity is constantly being negotiated depending on whose presence we find ourselves in. I had to transition from being a KAD who questioned their personal and ethnic identity in an American context to trying to locate my sense of belonging in a context that had a difficult time accepting me.

In the final stage, I transitioned into a position wherein I have come to better understand the complexity of my situation. I feel surprisingly less obligated to decide between being exclusively Korean or American. I have also come to terms with the fact that my ethnic identity and my personal identity do not have to be mutually exclusive. Rather than being defensive about my heritage, I have learned how to embrace that aspect of my identity. The most significant thing I learned from this process is that my identity will always be reconfiguring and in constant flux between my “Americaness” and my “Koreaness.”

Conclusion

Eleana Kim, a prolific ethnographer of adoption and adoptees, discusses in her article, “Wedding Citizenship and Culture: Korean Adoptees and The Global Family of Korea,” how KADs hold a very unique space within the “fourth culture”: an adoptee is not a part of the Korean culture, nor that of American. In fact, he or she is not even part of the Korean American immigrant culture. People who were born in South Korea, raised in America and are adoptees have been forced to create a cultural space that is uniquely their own (2003: 65). Indeed, this conceptualization of the KAD aptly reflects my own experience abroad.

I went to South Korea in search of more knowledge about the country and my dyadic existence. I undertook a physical journey that transformed the way I feel about adoption in the context of Korean culture, and I did not return empty handed. It was an intellectual and emotional journey as well, resulting in a different understanding of my identity. My goal in this paper has been to illustrate the complexity of a KAD’s return to South Korea in the context of the current government and public spheres. I want to demonstrate that such a journey does not always fill a void or answer all of one’s questions: it can be confusing, difficult, and emotionally straining. I now realize that the adoptee condition is unique, and despite the trials and tribulations that I have encountered in both American and Korean contexts, I am now proud to call myself a KAD. Dr. Isidore Lobnibe served as faculty sponsor for this article’s submission to PURE Insights.

Sources

Kim, Eleana

Kim, Eleana

Kondo, Dorinne K.

Lee, Jong-Yoon

Preblin, Elise

Shiao, Jiannbin Lee and Mia H. Tuan

Soon Huh, Nam and William J. Reid

Turner, Victor

U.S. Department of State

Volkman, Alice Ed.
A Review of Teachers' Perceptions and Training Regarding School Bullying

Abby K. Gorsek Western Oregon University
Melissa M. Cunningham Western Oregon University
Faculty Sponsor: Dr. Melissa M. Cunningham

This review will explore what is currently known regarding teachers’ perceptions, knowledge, and training regarding school bullying. Bullying is a serious issue for children and adolescents in schools. Research has consistently reported that bullying may cause lasting psychological and emotional problems (Mishna, Scarcello, Pepler, & Wiener, 2005). Teachers spend a significant amount of time with students at school and may be at the front-line of prevention and intervention strategies (Lund, Blake, Ewing, & Banks, 2012). One of the main determining factors in effectiveness of an anti-bullying program is the quality of staff training (Lund, et al., 2012). Research suggests that teachers are in great need of and desire more training on the topic of school bullying, its prevention, and effective intervention strategies. This review will highlight specific research areas where more information is needed about teachers’ perceptions, knowledge, and training regarding bullying in schools and how school districts can best use this information to target training programs for teachers.

Keywords: Bullying, Teachers’ Perceptions, Teachers’ Knowledge, Teachers’ Training, Bullying Prevention, Bullying Intervention

Every day an estimated 160,000 students miss school because they fear being bullied (Lund, Blake, Ewing, & Banks, 2012). In some cases, bullying can cause suicide (Barone, 1995) or have negative effects on long-term mental, physical, and social health (Mishna, Scarcello, Pepler, & Wiener, 2005; Pearce, Cross, Monks, Waters, & Falconer, 2011; Ttofi, & Farrington, 2012). Although bullying is a long-standing problem, it has only recently gained significant attention in schools and media (Craig, Bell, & Lescheid, 2011; Kennedy, Russom, & Kevorkian, 2012; Newman, Frey, & Jones, 2010; Strohmeier & Noam, 2012). Although experts generally agree that bullying is a “subset of direct or indirect aggressive behavior(s) characterized by intentional harm doing repetitive aggressive acts, and an imbalance of power” (Strohmeier & Noam, 2012, pg 8), no universal definition of bullying exists across school systems.

Despite a significant amount of research, which documents the effects of school bullying on students (Ttofi & Farrington, 2012), few studies address school bullying from a teacher’s perspective. As a result, even though teachers spend the most time with students in the school setting (Benitez, Garcia-Berden, & Fernandez-Cabezas, 2009; Craig et al., 2011; Lund et al., 2012; Newman et al., 2010) and are often in a position to help prevent bullying or to intervene, they may not always know when and how to respond (Mishna et al., 2005). This paper reviews general bullying prevention and intervention strategies pertinent to schools, summarizes what is currently known about teachers’ perceptions of school bullying and anti-bullying policies, and teachers’ level of training in administering bullying prevention and intervention strategies. In addition, multiple areas will be identified where more research is needed to understand school bullying from the teachers’ perspective. Furthermore, there will be a discussion of the application of this research for school districts to consider when planning anti-bullying strategies and related training for teachers or other school personnel.

General Bullying Prevention and Intervention Strategies

Successful bullying prevention and intervention efforts can be categorized into different levels: the community level, the school level, the classroom level, and the individual level (Limber, Flerx, Nation, & Melton, 1998; Olweus, 1993; Olweus & Limber, 2010). Although there is no “one size fits all” strategy that can be applied to all school systems (Swearer, Espelage, & Napolitano, 2011), some general components can make prevention/intervention efforts stronger.
As part of the Olweus Bullying Prevention Program (OBPP), Olweus and Limber (2010) provide some guidelines for setting up successful bullying prevention and intervention plans at multiple levels in schools. First, at the community level, the school should help develop a school-community partnership to support the anti-bullying programs. At the school level, it is recommended that anti-bullying policies are in place, and that all school personnel review and refine the rules along the side of the administrative staff. At the classroom level, bullying prevention information should be included in the curriculum for students. Lastly, at the individual level, teachers should hold meetings with the involved students – bullies and victims – and their family when bullying behavior continues and becomes more severe.

A component of a prevention and intervention plan should be the inclusion of younger children. Research shows school bullying starts as early as elementary school and peaks during the middle school years (Bowes et al., 2009; Goldweber, Waasdrop, & Bradshaw, 2012; Lawson, Alameda-Lawson, Downer, & Anderson, 2012). While prevention programs will work with older students due in part to the higher cognitive ability and maturity of the students (Baldry & Ferrington, 2002), it may take longer to obtain results (Olweus & Limber, 2010); prevention efforts targeted to younger children are more effective (Limber et al., 1998; Newman et al., 2010; Olweus & Limber, 2010; Ttofi & Farrington, 2012).

A larger, school-wide prevention strategy, as suggested by Olweus & Limber (2010), is a component of a strong prevention plan. Research, however, also supports targeted interventions for children at risk for developing bullying behaviors, or who are already bullying (Piotroski & Hoot, 2008). The first step in this process would be to identify students who would benefit from a targeted intervention. Behaviors that can help teachers and professionals identify bullies in their school system include high self-esteem (Piotrowski & Hoot, 2008; Sanders, 2004), the inability to empathize (Limber et al., 1998; Olweus, 1993; Piotrowski & Hoot, 2008), continuously breaking rules (Goldweber et al., 2012; Lawson et al., 2012), depression (Piotrowski & Hoot, 2008), poor social skills (Benitez et al., 2009; Newman et al., 2010; Nicolaides, Toda, & Smith, 2002), and aggression (Craig et al., 2011; Newman et al., 2010; Olweus, 1993; Piotrowski & Hoot, 2008; Sanders, 2004). Early detection of these risky factors may help educators properly identify the at-risk students and refer them for individualized or small group interventions.

Small group programs may also be a valuable component to a plan. A social worker, or other competent mental health professional, led small group program may also be effective, depending on age (Lawson et al., 2012). Several studies indicate that teachers and school counselors should lead small group interventions for elementary students and for middle school students, but not for high school students (Pearce et al., 2011; Swearer et al., 2011). Ttofi & Farrington (2012) found that small group interventions led by the students’ peers are ineffective, and recommend avoiding them. Both teachers and students rate role-playing as the least effective strategy (Crothers and Kolbert, 2004). Having a teacher or principal engage in a serious talk with the bully (or bullies), having the bully (or bullies) sit outside the principal’s office, and having the bully (or bullies) stay with a supervisor throughout free time were the most effective strategies for elementary students (Baldry & Ferrington, 2002; Ttofi & Farrington, 2012).

**Teachers’ Perceptions of Bullying**

Teachers are greatly unaware of bullying problems within their schools (Barone, 1995; Bauman & Del Rio, 2005; Beaty & Alexeyev, 2008; Bradshaw, Sawyer, & O’Brennan, 2007; Craig et al., 2011; Strohmeier & Noam, 2012), with students generally reporting that they are greatly aware of the same problems (Bauman & Del Rio, 2005; Beaty & Alexeyev, 2008; Bradshaw, Waasdrop, & O’Brennan, 2013; Mishna et al., 2005). In addition, many researchers report that school personnel have a difficult time distinguishing between school bullying and peer conflict (Bauman & Del Rio, 2005; Beaty & Alexeyev, 2008; Benitez et al., 2009; Newman et al., 2010; Strohmeier & Noam, 2012). Although psychologists have found that verbal bullying is the most common type of bullying (Goldweber et al., 2012; Lund et al., 2012; Piotroski & Hoot, 2008), many teachers and other school personnel do not perceive verbal aggression (e.g. name-calling and teasing) as bullying (Mishna et al., 2005). Barone (1995) suggests that many school personnel have been desensitized to bullying, and therefore, may have difficulty identifying it.

Another particularly challenging aspect in recognizing bullying in schools is that no universal definition for bullying exists. Unless everyone adopts a common definition within a school, there may be confusion among the school staff. When a common definition is used, teachers and other school personnel have reported greater confidence in managing bullying situations (Benitez et al., 2009; Craig et al., 2011; Newman et al., 2010). Thus, initial teacher training regarding bullying should include a school-wide definition to help with identification of bullying behaviors and increase teachers’ confidence levels.

**Teachers’ Perceptions of Anti-Bullying Policies**

Conflicting reports exist regarding the percentage of schools where anti-bullying policies are being
implemented. Lund and colleagues (2012) concluded that only 12% of participating schools in their study had anti-bullying policies in place, whereas Bradshaw and colleagues (2013) report that 92% of the schools studied had such policies in place. Even when policies exist, 60-80% of teacher participants reported that they believed the policies were not developmentally appropriate (Bradshaw et al., 2013; Kennedy et al., 2012; Lund et al., 2012). However, Bradshaw and colleagues (2013) report that even when a significant amount of teachers felt the policies were very effective (80%), the majority of students reported that they felt the policies were very ineffective. Teachers need to be aware that they may overestimate the effectiveness of school policies and their role in preventing future bullying. More training for teachers may be required to address this inconsistency between students’ and teachers’ perceptions of efficacy. Because such perceptions may vary widely between school districts, individual districts may consider surveying a sample of staff and students to better understand the perceptions held in their district, and use the data to inform future training and policy.

**Teachers’ Level of Training**

One of the main determining factors in effectiveness of an anti-bullying program is the quality of staff training (Lund et al., 2012). However, research about teachers’ and other school personnel training about bullying prevention and intervention is limited. In two studies, 93% and 87%, respectively, of those surveyed requested more training (Kennedy et al., 2012; Nicolaides et al., 2002). Bradshaw and colleagues (2013) studied the perceptions of teachers and educational support professionals and reported that both groups indicated interest in additional training regarding how to address sexual minority bullying. Mishna and colleagues (2005) report teachers want more training in verbal and relational anti-bullying programs.

Research suggests that although schools are providing in-service training across many educational areas, they often do not cover the topic of bullying (Bradshaw et al., 2013; Limber et al., 1998; Lund et al., 2012; Nicolaides et al., 2002). Lund and colleagues (2012) report that 74% of the school staff surveyed received anti-bullying training from professional conferences and not directly from their own school district. This may cause problems if different staff members within the same school system are trained to use different definitions and/or intervention models. School districts may consider providing in-service training regarding the specific anti-bullying policies of the district and how teachers are expected to participate in interventions. Targeted training for school personnel can improve their knowledge of bullying intervention skills, use of these skills, and self-efficacy in working with students to prevent bullying actions (Duy, 2013; Howard, Horne, & Jolliff, 2001).

Key components of anti-bullying training include: 1) how to detect school bullies; 2) how to identify the difference between the heavy bullying cases and the light bullying cases; and 3) knowing which intervention practices are appropriate for each case (Craig et al., 2011; Strohmier & Noam, 2012). It has been established that thorough training programs for teachers, which incorporate all of these key components, are not provided as standard training for many teachers (Bradshaw et al, 2013). Ideally, teachers should receive consistent training in this area. A universal class regarding bullying in their teacher preparation programs, with more specific training provided by their school district regarding any bullying policies and intervention programs adopted at the district or school level, could be a way to address this (Bauman & Del Rio, 2005; Benitez et al, 2009).

**Future Research: Teachers’ Knowledge and Confidence Levels**

Because teachers spend the most time with students at school, they may need to confront a bullying incident while, or immediately after, it occurs. When confronting a bullying incident, it is important that teachers provide effective, age-appropriate consequences. Yet, without training, teachers lack knowledge of effective discipline practices for bullying behavior, and confidence for implementing such strategies. In addition to this, more research is needed to fully explore the extent of teachers’ roles in providing targeted interventions to identified youth, and whether or not additional training will produce more effective outcomes.

Even if teachers are well trained to identify school bullying through the use of a common definition, it is important to examine teachers’ knowledge of effective bullying prevention and intervention strategies. This is especially pertinent if teachers are expected to play a role in implementing these strategies on a daily basis. Newman and colleagues (2010) found that teachers are the key players in efforts to prevent, or intervene in, bullying situations. In other words, teachers are thought of as “first responders” (Newman et al., 2010). However, it is unknown if teachers are knowledgeable and confident in assuming this role.

Although many researchers have identified early risk factors for bullying behavior (Craig et al., 2011; Nicolaides et al., 2002; Olweus, 1998; Piotrowski & Hoot, 2008; Sanders, 2004), future research needs to explore teachers’ knowledge of, and ability to identify, these early risk factors (e.g. depression, poor social skills, and aggression, etc.). Teachers’ ability to accurately identify bullies should also
be explored. These are very important if teachers are expected to participate in the identification process.

**Conclusion and Implications for School Districts**

Teachers and other school personnel need to have a general understanding of bullying and how to identify it. In addition, all teachers should be knowledgeable about any existing specific school policies regarding bullying, its prevention, and intervention practices. Ideally, school districts should provide training about such policies prior to the start of each school year. In addition, school districts should provide additional in-service training for teachers and school personnel so they are knowledgeable about current and updated information.

The evidence regarding the best age for prevention efforts suggests that, although all teachers would benefit from bullying prevention and intervention training, school districts may want to focus most intensely on providing training for elementary and middle school teachers, while providing continued support for teachers of older students. It is also important to incorporate bullying prevention/intervention information into the curriculum so that students learn what bullying is and how they can efficiently react to the bullying situations themselves. If both students and teachers become well educated about bullying prevention, use a common definition, and schools and teachers provide consistent consequences for bullying incidents, school bullying may be reduced. Becoming proficient with the intervention and prevention programs and/or curriculum used in their school may enhance teachers' confidence and self-efficacy in intervening in bullying situations.

Because quality of staff training is a key component in successful anti-bullying programs (Lund et al., 2012), school districts should focus on enhancing teachers' current level of knowledge and confidence in bullying prevention/intervention methods and their implementation.

School bullying is a long-standing problem with potentially severe consequences. Because teachers spend the most time with students while at school (Benitez et al., 2009; Craig et al., 2011; Lund et al., 2012; Newman et al., 2010), it is imperative for teachers to have knowledge and an understanding of effective bullying prevention and intervention programs. In addition it is important for school districts to regularly provide training to support teachers in such bullying prevention and intervention roles.

**References**


Lipstick and Granola: Perceptions of Feminism

Mycah L. Harrold Western Oregon University
Faculty Sponsor: Dr. Debi Brannan
Faculty Sponsor: Dr. Joel Alexander

The current study explored perceptions of feminists by comparing them to perceptions of non-feminist women using both a fictitious target woman and a measure of traditionally feminine and masculine traits. 40 undergraduate students (mean age of 23, S.D. = 7.18) were presented one photograph of a young woman (dressed-up, or dressed down) and one paragraph (describing her as, among other things, a feminist or not). Participants then completed a measure of traditionally feminist traits. Scores on this questionnaire were significantly different based on self-labeling, such that participants who were told the woman in the photograph self-labeled as a feminist perceived her to be more adhering to traditional feminist stereotypes. Participants also completed the Bem Sex Role Inventory (Bem, 1981) as they believed a "Typical Feminist" or a "Typical Woman" would. A "Typical Woman" was perceived to be fairly androgy nous, while a "Typical Feminist" had more extreme masculine and feminine scores. Overall, the findings of this study indicate that the feminist stereotype may be changing and that "typical women" can also be perceived to possess traits in accordance with the feminist stereotype.

Keywords: Feminism, Stereotypes, Gender Roles

Despite negative stigma and contrary to a line of popular culture beliefs (e.g., Bellafante, 1998), feminism is not dead (Eagly, Eaton, Rose, Riger & McHugh, 2012). Research has shown that a hesitancy to self-label does not indicate that today's college students disagree with the feminist movement and its ideals (Burn, Aboud & Moyles, 2000; Williams & Wittig, 1997). On the contrary, studies have shown high support for such goals (Aronson, 2003; Zucker, 2004). It appears that the perceptions of feminists largely account for this discrepancy. As feminism continues to grow and evolve, women have begun to tailor the movement to fit their own needs, which is the very essence of the "third wave" of feminism. Rowe-Finkbeiner (2004) claims this new wave is based on the simple concept that "there are many ways to be a feminist" (p. 31). No longer do all feminists fit the stereotype of man-hating, bra-burning angry activists (Groeneveld, 2009).

The first two waves of the feminist movement are easily differentiated; Rowe-Finkbeiner (2004) defines the first wave of feminism as occurring from 1848, the year of the historic Seneca Falls Convention, to 1920, when American women received the right to vote. This wave was characterized by the suffrage movement and established women as a political entity (Rowe-Finkbeiner, 2004). The second wave, which lasted from the 1960s to the 1980s, was led by women like Gloria Steinem and expanded to encompass a variety of goals, including ones pertaining to equal pay and opportunities, reproductive rights, and gender discrimination (Rowe-Finkbeiner, 2004). Backlash from men, the media, and at times women themselves, has been aimed at feminists from the beginning of the movement (Aronson, 2003). This negative appraisal has been used to explain the hesitancy of women to self-label as feminists, even when they agree with the goals of the movement (e.g., Twenge & Zucker, 1999).

The current study is aimed at exploring the ways in which college students perceive women and feminists, in terms of stereotypical feminist characteristics and traditionally feminine and masculine terms. It was designed to examine reactions toward feminists who do not fit the traditional stereotype and the ways in which such women are perceived.

Perceptions of Feminism

The feminist stereotype is complicated, multi-faceted and contains many emotion-provoking elements (Jost & Kay, 2005; Twenge & Zucker, 1999). A salient part of the stereotype is that feminists are traditionally perceived to be lesbians. While Twenge and Zucker (1999) found no support for the notion that feminists are lesbians, their participants perceived feminists as being more likely to be lesbians than the "average woman" and endorsed the notion that lesbians are generally unattractive. Feminists were also perceived to be politically liberal, assertive and focused on work and careers, especially when compared to non-feminist women. The feminist stereotype has both positive and negative components but feminists, especially in the negative elements, were described in more behavioral terms (e.g., assertiveness) than non-feminists.
Other perceptions closely related to notions of femininity and masculinity are also a part of the general feminist stereotype. Jost and Kay (2005) exposed participants to a list of agentic gender stereotypes (masculine) or communal ones (feminine) and then measured their feelings toward the current gender system. Women who had been exposed to the communal terms (e.g.: considerate, kind, gentle) showed increased support for the current gender system. Men, regardless of the manipulation received, strongly supported the gender system. The researchers proposed that this could potentially demonstrate why people justify our current gender system: the two categories (agentic and communal) can be seen as complementary. If the current system has support, and a goal of feminism is to invoke change, it would make sense why so few women self-label as feminists. Research has shown that the process of identifying as a feminist and the factors that discourage women from doing so are complicated and variable (Downing & Roush, 1985; Liss & Erchull, 2010; Williams & Wittig, 1997).

Fashion, Feminism and Heterosexual Romance

A controversial article appeared in a 2006 edition of BUST magazine, a publication for third wave of feminists, entitled, ‘Be A Feminist or Just Dress Like One’ (Groeneveld, 2009). Fashion has long been regarded by feminists as a way in which society reinforces patriarchy; a pro-feminist magazine publishing an article specifically about dress and clothing surprised some readers (Groeneveld, 2009). Groeneveld (2009) examined the context of this controversial article and its implications. She suggested that some self-proclaimed third wave feminists are reclaiming fashion and using it as mode for further empowerment. No longer are all feminists “Birkenstock-wearing, hippie, ‘granola’ lesbians (Groeneveld, 2009, p. 181).”

The notion that feminism is perceived by women, men and the media to work in opposition with beauty and fashionable women has been established (Cash, Ancis & Strachan, 1997; Groeneveld, 2009; Rudman & Fairchild, 2007). Rudman and Fairchild (2007) found that college students endorse the stereotype that feminists are unattractive. Participants responded to a series of questions about yearbook photographs of pretty and plain girls. The pictures of the plain women were more likely to correspond to predictions that the woman became a feminist. The researchers concluded that this idea closely follows the notion that women deemed plain or unattractive were less sexually-appealing to men and, therefore, were more likely to be lesbians, which made them more likely to be feminists (Rudman & Fairchild, 2007).

Traditionally, feminism has been viewed as antithetical to beauty and femininity. But, as the BUST article suggests, feminists may no longer agree with this; BUST readers saw that they can be both fashionable and feminists (Groeneveld, 2009). A new order of feminists, pop-culturally termed “third wave,” “girly,” and “lipstick” feminists, has emerged to include those women who are empowered by their femininity; however, little research has been conducted on this population. Ideas of femininity and beauty are so strongly linked in patriarchal society that the words are almost synonymous (e.g., Banziger & Hooker, 1979; Groeneveld, 2009). This link between femininity, beauty and heterosexual romance has implications for feminism and the perceptions associated with it. When feminism is perceived to oppose beauty and femininity, it can also appear as unsuited to hetero sexual romance. Rudman and Fairchild (2007) explored this issue: heterosexual male and female participants completed a measure of attitudes toward feminism, a four-item questionnaire to gauge the amount of conflict participants believed feminism would cause for a romantic relationship and a third questionnaire to explore the lesbian part of the feminist stereotype. Both men and women who saw feminism as a barrier to heterosexual romance were less likely to self-label as feminists.

Feminist Self-Labeling: Theory, Hesitancy & Predictors

The process of becoming a self-labeling feminist is a complex one. Downing and Roush (1985) proposed that the process of developing a feminist identity occurs in five distinct stages. Passive acceptance involves women unquestioningly accepting the current gender system. The second stage, revelation, is reached when women become aware of gender inequalities. The third stage, embeddedness, also referred to as emanation, involves women associating with like-minded individuals and exploring the feminist niche. Next, women combine their individual identities and their newly-acquired feminist ideals in the fourth stage, synthesis. The final stage is active commitment and entails women deliberately working to challenge gender inequality.

As this model was created almost thirty years ago, questions of its validity have been raised. More recently, Liss and Erchull (2010) conducted a study to reevaluate the Downing and Roush (1985) model, with particular emphasis on the synthesis stage, which has been thought to be the point at which individuals start self-labeling. The researchers found that, for their college-aged women participants, the only two stages strongly predictive of self-labeling were passive acceptance and active commitment. The researchers suggest that, because of their status in today’s gender system, women may begin at the synthesis.
stage even without any individual effort. Women at the synthesis stage felt empowered and capable but continued to accept traditional gender roles. Researchers suggest this may be because they were unaware of the inequality between genders and that these women also highly valued their femininity.

The tentativeness that people, especially women, seem to have toward self-labeling is seen as problematic by feminist scholars (see e.g., Burn, et al., 2000; Williams & Wittig, 1997; Zucker, 2004). It has long been observed that supporting feminist ideals does not necessarily mean one will self-label as a feminist (Myaskovsky & Wittig, 1997; Williams & Wittig, 1997). Myaskovsky and Wittig (1997) found that 51% of their college-aged women participants, while hesitant to self-label, supported the feminist movement in “all” or “most” of its goals. They concluded that women may avoid self-labeling not because they personally view feminism as negative, but because they believe others and society, in general, do so.

Burn et al. (2000) asked their male and female participants to complete the Liberal Feminist Attitude & Ideology Scale, which is considered a covert measure of feminism because it does not use the word “feminism.” The participants also answered an overt measure of feminism (“To what extent do you consider yourself a feminist?”). Participants were more likely to support covert than overt feminism and were more likely to express agreement with feminist principles than to actually self-label.

Extensive research has also been conducted in hopes of discovering predictors of feminist self-labeling (Moradi & Subich, 2002; Myaskovsky & Wittig, 1997; Roy, Weibust & Miller, 2007). Myaskovsky and Wittig (1997) discovered that the following factors help predict self-labeling: optimistically evaluating feminists and the women’s movement; having had contact and experience with feminists; having witnessed sexual discrimination; and supporting cooperative action. Williams and Wittig (1997) found that evaluating feminists positively, showing support for women working together to accomplish goals, and knowing feminists to be particularly predictive of one’s choosing to self-label. Roy et al. (2007) also found that participants who identified as feminists were very likely to express feeling the need to challenge generally accepted notions regarding gender. Moradi and Subich (2002) observed that non-feminists reported having experienced fewer circumstances of sex discrimination than feminists.

The Current Study

The present study was designed to explore perceptions of different types of feminists and elements of the feminist stereotype. Participants were given a packet of information about a young woman, and were then asked to rate the target on a list of stereotypically feminist traits. The second part involved use of the Bem Sex Role Inventory (BSRI; Bem, 1981) to give an indication of the participants’ perceptions of a “typical woman” or a “typical feminist.” This measure has been validated and used in numerous studies (e.g., Auster & Ohm, 2000).

Hypothesis 1. For Part 1 of the current study, it was hypothesized that when the target woman was shown dressed-up, regardless of feminist self-labeling status, she would elicit higher scores (meaning less conformity to typical feminist stereotypes) than when she was depicted as dressed-down.

Hypothesis 2. For Part 2 of the current study, it was expected that participants would attribute higher scores on traditionally masculine traits to a “typical feminist” when compared to a “typical woman.”

Method

Participants

This study was approved by the Institutional Review Board. The participants of this study included 40 undergraduate students (31 females) at a university in the Pacific Northwest. The mean age of participants was 23 years (S.D. = 7.18). The majority of participants were Caucasian (85%) and 10% were Hispanic/Latino. There was an almost equal representation of years in school (25% freshmen, 23% sophomores, 25% juniors, 23% seniors and 0.05% post-baccalaureate students). 17.5% reported being non-traditional students and 40% were psychology majors. Compensation in the form of extra credit slips to be used for psychology courses was given for participation.

Procedures

Advertising for the study was done using flyers posted on a bulletin board in the psychology department. Participants were randomly assigned to each condition. Prior to data collection, files were made up for each participant. These files included the informed consent form, a packet of materials for the first part of the study, the Bem Sex Role Inventory (Bem, 1981) and the demographics form. The packet for Part 1 included one photograph (of a dressed-up or dressed-down woman), one vignette (describing the target as a self-labeling feminist or explicitly stating that she does not self-label) and the questionnaire itself, to create four unique conditions. The instructions for the BSRI varied; half asked the participant to answer as a “typical woman” and the other half as a “typical feminist,” similar to the Twenge and Zucker (1999) study. Participants were given no further clarification from the researcher regarding the two terms. As the packets were compiled before data collection
began, the researcher gave each participant the one on top of the stack at the time they came in, thus ensuring random assignment to the various conditions.

Upon entering the testing area, participants read and signed an informed consent form. After giving consent, they were given their file of study materials and the researcher gave brief oral instructions regarding each section. The participants viewed the photograph/paragraph packet and rated the target on the measure of traditional feminist traits that had been created specifically for this study. Then, participants completed the BSRI, following the instructions to answer as either a “typical feminist” or a “typical woman” would. After completing the demographics form, participants were debriefed and given their extra credit slips.

**Materials**

The first part of this study involved four stimulus elements, which, when combined, created four unique conditions. Explanation of the elements follows.

**Dressed-Up Woman.** The dressed-up woman was a black-and-white photograph of a Caucasian woman aged 21 with dark hair and eyes. In the photograph, she wears a tight dress and high-heels; she has her hair straight down and is wearing make-up.

**Dressed-Down Woman.** This picture is of the same woman as the first and she is standing in the same position, facing the camera with arms at her side and a small smile. In this photograph, the model is wearing jeans and a flannel, long-sleeved shirt. She has her hair in two braids and is not wearing make-up.

**Vignettes.** One of two vignettes was paired with one of the above-mentioned photographs to create the four conditions. The paragraphs described a typical college student and were the same except for the final sentence, “She [does not] identify as a feminist and attributes this to the way she was raised.” (The vignettes are included in the Appendix.)

The combination of photographs and vignettes created four unique situations: a dressed-down woman, a dressed-up woman, a dressed-up feminist (to suggest the “Lipstick Feminist” stereotype) and a dressed-down feminist (to suggest the “Granola Feminist” stereotype).

**Measures**

**Adherence to Feminist Stereotype.** To evaluate the participants’ perceptions of the woman in the photograph and described in the vignette, a measure was created that instructed participants to rate the woman on a Likert scale of 1. *Always Describes Her* to 4. *Never Describes Her*. A number of studies have been designed to identify words and phrases that are commonly believed to be associated with the feminist stereotype. Using two of these studies, the researcher chose, and created the measure around, 25 terms that have been found to be part of the feminist stereotype (Jost & Kay, 2005; Twenge & Zucker, 1999), such as “She is strong,” “She is politically liberal” and “She is a lesbian.” Nine of the terms were reverse coded because they represent elements contrary to the general feminist stereotype, including “She is nurturing” and “She is submissive.” The complete list of terms is included in Appendix 1.

**Perceptions of Sex Roles.** The second part of the study utilized the 40-item version of the Bem Sex Role Inventory (Bem, 1981). This inventory was designed to measure one’s level of masculinity and femininity. Participants rated all of the terms on a Likert-type scale, with 1 = Never, 4 = Neutral and 7 = Always. Some of the masculine terms include: assertive, forceful and athletic, while examples of feminine traits are: shy, childlike and sympathetic. Participants completed this inventory as they perceived either a “typical woman” or a “typical feminist” would answer.

**Design**

The first part of the study was a 2 (Photograph: dressed-up, dressed-down) X 2 (Paragraph: feminist, non-feminist) design with a dependent variable of ratings on a list of stereotypical feminist traits. The second part of this study included two variations (“Typical Woman,” “Typical Feminist”) and the dependent variable was score on the BSRI.

**Results**

The mean scores (+1 S.E.) for feminist stereotype traits for the Dressed-Up/Dressed-Down and Feminist/Non-Feminist conditions are displayed in Figure 1. The measure used was created to examine perceived adherence to the feminist stereotype and lower scores indicate the target was believed to possess more feminist characteristics. The average score for the dressed-up feminist was 2.51 (S.D. = 0.17) and the average score for the dressed-down feminist was 2.48 (S.D. = 0.24). The average score for the dressed-up non-feminist was 2.69 (S.D. = 0.14) and the average score for the dressed-down non-feminist was 2.79 (S.D. = 0.20).

Next, an analysis of variance test was conducted to examine the mean differences between each group. The omnibus test was significant, F(3, 36) = 3.10, p = .002 and the relationship between conditions and average level of evaluations was strong, η2 = .34. Further, to control for Type I error across multiple pairwise comparisons, Tukey HSD post hoc tests were conducted. Results revealed significant differences between the dressed-up feminist and the dressed-down non-feminist (SE = .09, p = .01) and...
between the dressed-down non-feminist and the dressed-down feminist (SE = .09, p = .004). Finally, there were marginally significant results between the dressed-up non-feminist and the dressed-down non-feminist (SE = .09, p = .07).

The mean Masculine and Feminine scores (+1 S.E.) corresponding to the “Typical Woman” and “Typical Feminist” BSRI conditions are displayed in Figure 2. The means scores for the various conditions were as follows: in the “typical feminist” condition, the average feminine score was 4.04 (SD = .87) and the average masculine score was 5.97 (SD = .53). In the “typical woman” condition, the average feminine score was 5.05 (SD = .62) and the average masculine score was 4.20 (SD = .55). Moreover, results revealed significant differences between the “typical feminist” condition and the “typical woman” condition on the average BSRI feminine scores, $F(1,39)=10.56$, $p < 0.001$, $\eta^2 = .32$. There were similar patterns for the two conditions on the average BSRI masculine scores, $F(1,39)=109.51$, $p < 0.001$, $\eta^2 = .74$.

Discussion

For Part 1 of this study, it was hypothesized that the dressed-up photograph would receive higher scores (meaning less conformity to typical feminist traits) in both conditions. This hypothesis was not supported, as the conditions to receive the highest scores were actually the two non-feminist ones (dressed-down feminist and dressed-up feminist). When looking specifically at mean scores, the feminist label appears to have been more of a determinant of scores than the type of dress. The two conditions that included a feminist label had the two lower average scores and the two without the label had the higher scores, indicating that the “feminists” were perceived as more conforming to the traditional feminist stereotype.

Significant differences were found between the two dressed-down conditions. The dressed-down non-feminist was seen as significantly less conforming than the dressed-down feminist. This finding was unsurprising and provides further evidence of the strength of the feminist stereotype; self-labeling as a feminist increases the likelihood of being perceived as adhering to the feminist stereotype.

Looking beyond the dressed-down conditions, significant differences were also found between the dressed-down non-feminist and dressed-up feminist conditions. This is also unsurprising, as these two conditions are exact opposites. The finding suggests that a woman dressed-down and not wearing make-up was seen as significantly less conforming to the feminist stereotype than a dressed-up woman who self-labels as a feminist. Considering the observation with the mean scores, this could be related mostly to the label.
Marginal differences were found between the dressed-up non-feminist and the dressed-down non-feminist, such that the dressed-up woman was seen as slightly more conforming to the feminist stereotype than her dressed-down counterpart. This trend is surprising; in the past, it could have been predicted that a dressed-down woman without makeup would be perceived as more of a feminist, but this study found that the opposite was true.

Rudman and Fairchild (2007) found that when participants were presented with yearbook photographs, they (all of whom were heterosexual men and women) were more likely to predict the woman was a lesbian if she was unattractive. This provides strong evidence that lesbianism is a strong component of the traditional feminist stereotype. Because of this, and similar findings, “She is a lesbian” was included as an item on the questionnaire for Part 1 of this study. Findings from the current study, however, do not provide such strong evidence of this association. All but two of the 40 participants responded “Rarely Describes Her” or “Never Describes Her” to this item. Of the two who responded “Always Describes Her” (none chose “Often Describes Her”), one was in the dressed-up/feminist condition and the other was in the dressed-down/non-feminist condition. This appears to refute the notion that lesbianism is strongly linked with the feminist stereotype, but as the current study only used a single item in one questionnaire to examine this, more research is needed in this area to make broader conclusions.

In general, the findings for Part 1 were intriguing: They suggest that the feminist stereotype and the label can strongly influence evaluations made about a woman. These findings also suggest that a change has occurred in the way women are viewed; the perception of the dressed-up woman as adhering to the feminist stereotype could mean that being seen as ultra-feminine and girly did not indicate that she could not have also been perceived to be ambitious and professional.

Part 2 of this study also provided interesting results. It was hypothesized that the “typical feminist” condition would lend itself to higher masculine scores than the “typical woman” condition; this hypothesis was supported and significant differences were found across condition (Feminist/Woman) and component (masculine/feminine). Masculine scores were significantly higher in the feminist condition and feminine scores were significantly higher in the woman condition. A more complete picture emerges when considering the averages for each condition and component; the feminist condition produced the extreme scores (high masculine, low feminine) while the woman condition showed moderate scores for both components. This observation was unanticipated because it would be expected that the typical woman would receive high feminine and low masculine scores. The BSRI was developed to measure the extent to which one adheres to traditionally feminine and traditionally masculine traits. The findings suggest that a “typical woman” is viewed as fairly androgynous and that a “typical feminist” is very masculine and less feminine.

A re-evaluation of the BSRI items by Auster and Ohm (2000) used the same statistical process and requirements for inclusion of terms that Bem used in 1974. The researchers provided interesting insight into the current study’s findings regarding the BSRI scores. Eight of the original 20 masculine terms met the requirements used in the feminist stereotype questionnaire designed for this study (i.e., “forceful,” “independent”) are related to parts of the feminist stereotype and even align with items used in the feminist stereotype questionnaire used in this study (i.e., “act as a leader,” “career-oriented,” “overbearing,” “driven,” “bossy” were all included in the measure for this study).

The current study presents a few limitations. The dressed-down photograph used in Part 1 may not have been drastic enough to invoke the “granola feminist” stereotype hoped for. The woman in the picture is wearing clothes that, while not particularly feminine, are still fitted. The questionnaire for Part 1 and the BSRI include a number of large or unfamiliar words (i.e., yielding, flatterable, and self-sufficient). A few participants asked for definitions of words they did not understand, but it is possible that others did not understand the words but failed to ask for such clarification. The researcher conducting the study was a young woman, which could have intimidated participants, given the gendered nature of the study, and influenced them to not answer entirely truthfully, if they believed she would be offended. The fact that the study utilized a small sample size of only forty participants is an additional limitation.

While much research has been conducted around feminist self-labeling (e.g., Liss & Erchull, 2010; Myaskovsky & Wittig, 1997; Zucker, 2004) and components of the feminist stereotype (e.g., Jost & Kay, 2005; Tewen & Zucker, 1999), little has been done to explore the newly emerging “lipstick feminist.” Today’s young people are aware of this result of “third-wave feminism” (Groeneveld, 2009) and seem to accept that feminists can, in fact, also be feminine. Future studies could probe this phenomenon further to explore the similarities and differences these feminists have with the traditional “granola feminist” of years past. It would also be interesting to examine how women who identify as “lipstick” or “girly” feminists perceive their feminism and overcome the stereotypical perceptions of it. The relatively new term “lipstick lesbian” has emerged to describe feminine lesbians (Beli, Binnie, Cream & Valentine, 1994);
a direction for future research could be to examine the ways this new label influences perceptions of who is a lesbian and who is a feminist.

Overall, two broad trends emerge when looking at the findings of this study as a whole. First, the feminist label is powerful and vivid. It is an emotion-provoking word and it is linked with a strong, extreme stereotype. Second, the findings support the notion that women start out in a more enlightened, empowered position than they have in the past (Liss & Erchull, 2010); even a “typical woman” is seen as more traditionally masculine, which suggests dressing-up may be more likely to be perceived as professional and less as feminine and girly.

Overall, the findings of this study are enlightening. They suggest that the feminist stereotype is changing. Components of the traditional feminist stereotype that held negative connotations may not be so strongly linked in the minds of today’s college students. This study has shown a broadening of strict gender expectations, in that non-feminists and feminists alike were perceived to be relatively similar on a list of positive and negative traits traditionally associated with feminists. “Typical women” have been seen to possess masculine traits, almost in equal numbers to their feminine traits. The data suggests that confining, limiting gender stereotypes are being blurred and college students are ready to accept more ambiguity in this area.

Appendix 1. Feminist Stereotype Questionnaire

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Always Describes Her</th>
<th>Often Describes Her</th>
<th>Rarely Describes Her</th>
<th>Never Describes Her</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>She is strong.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is intelligent.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is submissive.*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is stubborn.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is warm.*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is opinionated.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is demanding.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is politically liberal.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is domineering.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is career-oriented.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is emotionally-needy.*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is knowledgeable.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is confident.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is overbearing.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is angry.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is anti-male.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is nurturing.*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is fashionable.*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She is traditional.*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

She is driven.
She is a lesbian.
She is popular.*
She is bossy.
She is pretty.*
She is friendly.*

*These items were reverse-coded

Appendix 2. Vignettes

Lindsey is a 21-year-old senior. She grew up in Oregon with her parents, older sister and younger sister. After high school, she started studying Communications at a university on the West Coast. She works as a Resident Assistant on campus. She enjoys conversation and walking her dog. She identifies as a feminist and attributes this to the way she was raised.

Lindsey is a 21-year-old senior. She grew up in Oregon with her parents, older sister and younger sister. After high school, she started studying Communications at a university on the West Coast. She works as a Resident Assistant on campus. She enjoys conversation and walking her dog. She does not identify as a feminist and attributes this to the way she was raised.

References


An Examination of the First Years: Novice ESOL Teachers’ Experiences with Loneliness and Stress

Randal K. Johnson Western Oregon University
Mycah L. Harrold Western Oregon University
Daisy J. Cochran Western Oregon University
Debi Brannan Western Oregon University
Tasha Bleistein Azusa Pacific University

For new teachers, the first years can be particularly difficult; this is especially true for ESOL teachers (Brannan & Bleistein, 2012; Warford & Reeves, 2003). To further examine potential issues for this important group, this study specifically examined the relationship between loneliness and stress for novice Teachers of English to Speakers of Other Languages (TESOL). Forty-seven novice TESOL professionals completed self-report measures assessing their levels of perceived stress and loneliness. The results revealed that loneliness significantly predicted perceived stress ($\beta = .52$, $p < .001$). Furthermore, exploratory analyses indicated that marital status influenced loneliness ratings but not stress levels. These findings indicate that for novice teachers that often teach abroad, feelings of loneliness are an important issue to consider.

Keywords: novice, TESOL, ESOL, loneliness, stress, teachers

Teaching can be a stressful and psychologically demanding profession. In order to be successful in the field, teachers are responsible for completing a variety of tasks inside and outside of the classroom and are often required to assume multiple roles in the communities that they serve (Dussault, Deaudelin, Royer, & Loiselle, 1999). Managing these responsibilities can be especially challenging for novice teachers who have little experience pragmatically engaging in the pedagogical process (Gavish & Friedman, 2010). Novice teachers are often expected to independently adapt to these stressors with little direct assistance from colleagues or mentors (Farrell, 2003; Farrell, 2006; Peacock, 2009), which may result in feelings of isolation and loneliness (Flinders, 1988; Gaikwad & Brantley, 1992). Importantly, research has demonstrated that these feelings of loneliness can be distressing and can actually increase the amount of stress that teachers normally encounter (Dussault et al., 1999).

Much of the research pertaining to loneliness and stress among teachers has focused on those working in traditional teaching environments. These studies have not fully examined how loneliness may increase stress levels for teachers working in specialized fields or nontraditional classrooms. Consequently, further research is needed to gain a better understanding of the relationship between loneliness and stress for teachers that work with unique student populations. Moreover, research suggests that novice teachers in the field of Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages (TESOL) may be a particularly vulnerable teaching population that requires further examination (Farrell, 2009).

English to Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) teachers are trained to teach English to second language learners from areas where English is not the primary language or mother tongue, and can choose to provide these services domestically or in students’ home countries. Teaching in linguistically and culturally diverse classrooms may be particularly challenging, and research has demonstrated that novice ESOL teachers are especially likely to experience stressful situations that encourage early attrition from the field (Ingersoll & Smith, 2003; Maciejeski, 2007; Peacock, 2009). TESOL teachers face unique professional challenges; most significantly, they work with learners who are crossing linguistic or cultural boundaries within the classroom. In addition, TESOL educators who work outside of their home country may have a diminished social support network. Research has also shown that ESOL educators in U.S. classrooms feel isolated from mainstream classroom teachers due to school policies or attitudes toward students (DelliCarpini, 2009). Even English language educators who are working within their own country with students from the same cultural background (e.g., a Chinese English teacher working with Chinese English learners) face the stress of engaging students in a language that may seem impractical and unnecessary. In order to explore how loneliness influences overall feelings of distress experienced by novice ESOL teachers, the current study examined the correlational relationship between novice
ESOL teachers’ perceptions of loneliness and their perceptions of stress. In addition, this study assessed whether marital status and gender were uniquely associated with novice ESOL teachers’ perceptions of loneliness or stress, and if these two factors influenced the relationship between perceptions of loneliness and stress.

Loneliness

Perlman and Peplau (1981) posited that the experience of loneliness is often associated with powerful emotions that are caused by the perception that social resources, interpersonal connections, or conduits for these resources and connections are qualitatively or quantitatively deficient. Furthermore, Hawkley, Brown, and Cacioppo (2005) suggested that general feelings of loneliness are likely to have multiple potential causes, including perceptions of being rejected or isolated, having inadequate emotional and instrumental social support from interpersonal interactions and friendships, and lacking a sense of connectedness within the larger community. Importantly, loneliness is associated with a variety of negative psychological, physical, and social outcomes. According to research by Segrin and Passalacqua (2010) that assessed the mediational relationship between loneliness, stress, social support, and health behaviors, loneliness is highly correlated with perceived stress and is indirectly related to negative health behaviors due to its association with higher levels of perceived stress. Moreover, loneliness has been found to negatively impact career outcomes as well. In a study examining how the quality of work relationships influences organizational commitment and satisfaction with life, Yilmaz (2008) found that teachers who perceived their relationships with colleagues as being inadequate reported less satisfaction with life and lower levels of organizational commitment.

Loneliness in Teachers

Several studies have indicated that there are multiple factors that increase the likelihood that teachers, specifically, will experience social isolation and subsequent feelings of loneliness (Flinders, 1988; Gaikwad & Brantley, 1992). Researchers have suggested that because teachers encounter many potentially isolating experiences, they appear to have a relatively high susceptibility to developing perceptions of loneliness and stress. For example, in many universities abroad, the "foreign" English teacher is not invited to faculty meetings where the local professors socialize and discuss policies, curriculum, and students. Research suggests that teachers are expected to be independent, self-sufficient units who work specifically in their own classroom, a phenomenon deemed “egg-crate isolation” (Flinders, 1988; Gaikwad & Brantley, 1992). Flinders (1988) posits that while teachers may have thousands of social interactions in the course of a day, it is the perception of these social interactions that makes the difference; teachers likely feel that they are unable to communicate in a satisfying manner with their coworkers, and these unsatisfying interactions may cause them to feel misunderstood. This assertion was supported by Pithers and Fogarty's (1995) examination of whether perceptions of social isolation were more prevalent among teachers or urban professionals. This study demonstrated that teachers were much more likely to report being socially isolated and that these experiences with social isolation were highly associated with perceived stress.

Research has indicated that novice teachers may encounter special circumstances that make them more susceptible to feelings of loneliness. DelliCarpini (2009) interviewed 18 English as a Second Language (ESL) MA teacher candidates about their experiences working as novice teachers, and collaborating with mainstream English teacher candidates to develop interdisciplinary educational strategies for English Language Learners (ELL). Although they reported having high expectations on their first day of school, the novice ESL teachers indicated that the dismal condition of their resources, or lack of resources, decreased their enthusiasm for work (DelliCarpini, 2009). The novice ESL teachers also reported feeling as though they had little to no help from their mentors and reported inadequate access to their mentors (DelliCarpini, 2009). This lack of support and perceived isolation from other teachers led to the novice ESL teachers feeling unprepared for daily class activities, and questioning their ability to educate their students (DelliCarpini, 2009). These conditions could be especially problematic for novice teachers because inadequate interaction and support may hinder further professional development (Sato & Kleinsasser, 2004) or increase the likelihood of the teachers leaving the field. The DelliCarpini (2009) study offers information that is pertinent and applicable to the current study; the findings, however, must be interpreted with some caution. The study was mostly exploratory and included a limited number of participants. However, it is noteworthy because it provides a research-based exploration of workplace isolation and a foundation for conducting research on other novice teacher populations. Currently, there is relatively little empirical research examining loneliness among novice teachers, and novice ESOL teachers, specifically, and the current study seeks to rectify this deficiency.

Perceived Stress in Teachers

The psychological and physiological effects of stress are experienced when an individual is overwhelmed with the demands of their environment (Cohen, Kessler, & Gordon, 1995). Because of various interpersonal
pressures such as interactions with coworkers, students, supervisors, and parents, research suggests that the teaching environment can be particularly stressful (Dussault et al., 1999). Furthermore, novice ESOL teachers, who feel unprepared for the teaching environment, may be especially susceptible to feelings of distress (Farrell, 2012). Teachers who report increased stress levels often report lower job satisfaction, decreased self-efficacy, and feelings of professional isolation (Dussault et al., 1999; Klassen & Chiu, 2010). Additionally, having an impaired mind and body has been found to negatively affect work productivity and motivation (Van der Klink, Blonk, Schene, & Van Dijk, 2001). Importantly, experiencing these feelings of distress can significantly impact a teacher’s overall job performance and satisfaction.

A factor that has been shown to affect teachers’ perceived stress and self-efficacy is the gender of the teacher (Klassen & Chiu, 2010). Klassen and Chiu (2010) reported that, of their sample, female teachers with the least experience were shown to be the most stressed. Differences in perceived stress levels were shown among gender through differences in self-reported perceived stress levels and heart rate throughout the school year (Klassen & Chiu, 2010; Moya-Albiol, Serrano, & Salvador, 2010). Female teachers experienced more workload stress and classroom stress than male teachers (Klassen & Chiu, 2010). In general, regardless of gender, teachers with higher perceived stress will be more likely to leave the profession (Moya-Albiol, Serrano, & Salvador, 2010).

The Current Study
Although considerable literature exists regarding perceptions of stress and loneliness among traditional K-12 teachers, research pertaining to teachers in non-traditional roles, such as ESOL teachers, is lacking. Therefore, the purpose of the current study was to supplement the literature and address a unique, but important, professional population. A relationship between stress and perceived social isolation in teachers, especially those new to the profession, has been established by previous research (Dussault et al., 1999; Klassen & Chiu, 2010). The current study assessed whether this relationship is present in novice ESOL teachers, specifically. Considering that previous research has demonstrated that different social factors may moderate this relationship in other teaching populations (Klassen & Chiu, 2010; Moya-Albiol, Serrano, & Salvador, 2010), this study also explored whether the perceived stress-loneliness relationship is moderated by gender and marital status. Specifically, this study addressed 1) whether there was a relationship between loneliness and stress, 2) whether gender moderates this relationship, and 3) whether relationship status moderates this association.

Methods
Participants
Invitations to participate in the study were emailed to 67 recent graduates (within three years) from two hybrid Master’s level TESOL (Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages) graduate programs. These programs provide face-to-face and distance or online instruction, and allow students to pursue MA TESOL degrees from U.S. universities, while living around the world. The invitations were accepted by 70% (N=47) of the graduates. All participants had worked as teachers and 83% (N=39) of them were still employed at the time of the study.

Demographic data were also collected, such as marital status, gender, race, and number of children. Of those who participated in the study, 56% (N=26) were female. In addition, 67% (N =14) of the men were married or living with a partner, while only 35% (N=9) of the females were married. Overall, 40% (N=19) of participants reported having children. Also, 52% (N=11) of male participants and 31% (N=8) of female participants reported having children. Most participants originated from the United States (91%) and affiliated with being white (86%).

Those living in the United States equaled 47% (N=22). Fifty-three percent of participants (N=25) reported that they were teaching abroad, with 34% (N=16) teaching in China; 4% (N=2) in South Korea; and the remaining participants, 15% (N=7), within Australia, Honduras, Kazakhstan, Laos, Mongolia, Turkey, or Vietnam. Most participants taught in higher education, with 55% (N=25) at universities and 23% (N=11) in other adult schools.

Procedure
As part of a larger study, an email invitation was sent out to 67 ESOL teachers asking them to participate in this study. The individuals that chose to participate in the study were re-directed to a secure confidential survey site. Before they completed the survey, they reviewed the informed consent that explained details about the study. Demographic data were also collected prior to the study. The teachers were then asked to rate their perceived stress and answer a single item about their loneliness.

Measures
Loneliness. A single item from the Positive and Negative Affect Scale (PANAS; Watson, Clark, & Tellegen, 1988) was employed to assess loneliness. Participants rated how frequently they felt lonely the past week on a 5-point scale, ranging from 1 (not at all) to 5 (extremely). It is important to note that research has demonstrated that
Results

Descriptive Statistics

First, when examining mean levels of our variables of interest, results revealed that for the entire sample, the mean level of loneliness was 1.91 (SD = 1.16). We then examined these variables by gender. Results revealed that for males, the average level of loneliness was 1.48 (SD = .87); for females, the mean level of loneliness was 2.27 (SD = 1.25).

To examine perceived stress, we obtained a sum rating of perceived stress for each participant (per Cohen et al., 1983) and results revealed that the overall mean perceived stress rating was 7.05 (SD = 2.33). When examining this variable by gender, results revealed that males’ rating for perceived stress as 6.10 (SD = 1.70); females had a mean rating of 7.85 (SD = 2.49).

To further test these differences, an independent t-test was then conducted and results revealed that mean levels of loneliness were significantly higher among female teachers than males, t(46) = -2.46, p = .02. Interestingly, an analysis of the mode revealed that 71.4% of the men (N = 15) reported that they were “not at all” lonely; of those men, 14 reported being married or living with someone. In contrast, females’ response patterns exhibited considerably more variability. When we examined whether marital status played a role in loneliness for each gender, results demonstrated that men who were married/living with a partner were significantly less lonely compared to men who were single. More specifically, single men had an average rating of 2.43 (SD = .98) and men who were married/living with partner reported an average rating of loneliness of 1 (SD = .00); t(19) = 5.63, p < .001. Similar results were found for women, whereby single women had an average rating of loneliness of 2.59 (SD = 1.37); and women who were married/living with partner reported an average rating of 1.67 (SD = .71); t(25) = 2.04, p = .05.

Moreover, an independent sample t-test was conducted and there were significant gender differences in perceived stress, t(45) = -2.74, p < .01, such that the women participants reported higher levels of stress than men. When examining stress by marital status, results revealed that single men had a perceived stress rating of 7.00 (SD = 1.63) and men who were married/living with a partner reported perceived stress of 5.64 (SD = 1.60); t-tests revealed no significant differences between the two groups. Similar results were found for women, whereby the perceived stress rating for single women was 8.29 (SD = 2.62); and women who were married/living with partner reported 7.00 (SD = 2.12); again, no significant differences were found between single and married females. See table 1 for a visual summary of the means and standard deviations for loneliness and perceived stress categorized by gender and relationship status.

Table 1. Means and Standard Deviations for Loneliness and Perceived Stress

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Loneliness</th>
<th></th>
<th>Perceived Stress</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>SD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Sample</td>
<td>1.91</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>7.05</td>
<td>2.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male Total</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>6.10</td>
<td>1.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>2.43</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>7.00</td>
<td>1.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>5.64</td>
<td>1.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female Total</td>
<td>2.27</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>7.85</td>
<td>2.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>2.59</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>8.29</td>
<td>2.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In</td>
<td>1.67</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>7.00</td>
<td>2.12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Primary Analyses

To further analyze the possible connection between loneliness and stress in novice ESOL teachers, a hierarchical linear regression was conducted. Specifically, we regressed loneliness, marital status, and gender in a moderated model on perceived stress. To create an interaction term, the two independent variables in each model were multiplied (see Cohen, Cohen, West, & Aiken,
Inconsistencies in the literature. Willemsen, Dolan, Hawkley, & Cacioppo, 2005; finding that males are lonelier than women (Boomsma, Rokach, & Furnham, 2001, Geeraert & Demoulin, 2013). Therefore, being located in a foreign country may have influenced relationships between gender and loneliness on perceived stress ($\beta = .01, p < .96$).

Another hierarchical linear regression was conducted to determine if marital status moderated the loneliness-stress relationship. The main effects revealed that there was only a significant association between loneliness and perceived stress ($\beta = .54, p = .001$). In the model that included the interaction term, there were no significant associations.

**Discussion**

ESOL teachers represent a unique portion of the teaching and professional population, often working in linguistically and culturally diverse classroom settings, either in their nation of origin or abroad. Although teaching, in general, can be a challenging and stressful profession, novices in the TESOL field are especially likely to encounter distressing and discouraging situations, which ultimately lead to a greater likelihood of exiting the field entirely (Peacock, 2009). In order to supplement the current understanding of the factors that influence novice ESOL teachers’ mental health and occupational success, this study examined the relationship between loneliness and stress for 47 novice ESOL teachers.

Previous research has demonstrated that loneliness is correlated with stress for experienced teachers (Dussault et al., 1999), and consistent with these findings, regression analyses revealed that novice ESOL teachers who reported higher levels of loneliness were more likely to experience greater amounts of perceived stress than their less lonely counterparts. These results suggest that, similar to teachers working in traditional teaching fields, novice ESOL teachers are likely to be adversely affected by feelings of loneliness and isolation.

Russell, Peplau, and Cutrona (1980) suggest that gender is not associated with variations in loneliness, and overall, gender appears to be an inconsistent predictor of loneliness with some studies finding that males are lonelier than females (Eshbaugh, 2008; Koc, 2012), and others finding that females are lonelier than males (Boomsma, Willemsen, Dolan, Hawkley, & Cacioppo, 2005; Rokach, 2000; Victor & Yang, 2012). The finding that women were lonelier than men could be arbitrary and reflect the inconsistencies in the literature. Additionally, research has found that men are often more reluctant to admit experiencing negative emotions, in general (Borys & Perlman, 1985), and are less likely to discuss feelings of loneliness when they exhibit higher levels of masculinity (Cramer & Neyedly, 1998). However, these results could suggest that women did not have the same experiences or circumstances as men. Further research should explore whether these gender differences in loneliness are due to factors unique to the TESOL profession, and consider whether the cultures within which novice ESOL teachers work play a part in increased loneliness levels.

The current body of research indicates that being married or in a relationship is often negatively associated with loneliness (Hawthorne, 2008; Hawkley, Browne, & Cacioppo, 2005; Victor & Yang, 2012). However, it is surprising that this relationship was more profound for males. These findings could reflect gender differences in how relationships are defined and evaluated. A study by Stokes and Levin (1986) found that the quantity of relationships had a consistently negative relationship with loneliness for males but not for females, whereas females’ perceptions of loneliness appeared to be influenced by how they rated the quality of their relationships. Though, as previously mentioned, these results may simply be due to gender differences in the propensity for discussing negative emotions and loneliness. Notably, these exploratory findings regarding the relationship between marital status, gender, and loneliness could indicate that males and those that are married may enjoy a certain amount of protection from loneliness as novice ESOL teachers. Other studies should examine how these characteristics and other factors can influence loneliness and stress for novices in the TESOL field.

**Limitations**

This study may have had several limitations that could impact the validity and generalizability of the findings. Firstly, there were only 47 participants, and, therefore, the sample size was relatively small. Although future examinations would benefit from a larger sample, this study recruited participants with heterogeneous backgrounds that were highly representative of the novice ESOL teacher population.

Additionally, approximately half of the participants were living and working in foreign countries (51%) when they completed the study. Research has shown that cross-cultural adjustments are associated with higher levels of loneliness (Chataway & Berry, 1989; Pruitt, 1978; Sam & Eide, 1991; Swami, 2009), and both increases and decreases in perceived stress for sojourning students living abroad (Ward & Kennedy, 1996; Ward, Bochner, & Furnham, 2001, Geeraert & Demoulin, 2013). Therefore, being located in a foreign country may have influenced
how the participants rated their perceptions of loneliness and stress. Future research should examine whether novice ESOL teachers living abroad are more likely to experience loneliness and stress compared to those living in their countries of origin.

It is important to note that 79% were still in the teaching profession and the qualitative data revealed that a few were in the process of moving and/or looking for new teaching jobs. Also, some had left teaching for other professions or personal reasons such as pregnancy. Although some of the participants were no longer teaching at the time of the survey, all of the participants had taught for a certain amount of time after completing their MA degrees.

Importantly, this study did not provide conclusive evidence that novice ESOL teachers are lonelier or more stressed than other groups and this concern should be addressed in future research. Moreover, the current findings are correlational in nature and the researchers would like to acknowledge that conclusions about the directionality of this relationship cannot be made based on this data. It is unclear if teachers’ loneliness precedes stress, if their stress induces loneliness, or if additional factors are influencing this relationship. Therefore, future studies should explore how other factors, such as culturally based gender norms and individual traits, influence the relationship between loneliness and stress for novice ESOL teachers.

Conclusion

Ensuring that ESOL teachers are mentally healthy and satisfied with their working conditions could have significant implications for the success of the institutions that hire them and, consequently, the credibility of the TESOL programs that they are representing. Importantly, this examination of novice ESOL teachers’ experiences with loneliness and stress could be a vital step toward understanding the factors that influence and improve TESOL professionals’ mental health, job satisfaction, and occupational outcomes. The findings from this study suggest that mitigating feelings of loneliness may have a significant impact on the perceptions of stress experienced by novice ESOL teachers. Because many of the stressors encountered by novices in the TESOL field are associated with difficulties adjusting to the professional teaching environment and are thus often unavoidable, managing perceptions of loneliness could be an effective and accessible strategy for reducing perceptions of stress (Farrell, 2012). Therefore, pre-service, novice, and, potentially, experienced ESOL teachers may benefit from developing and maintaining professional relationships that could reduce feelings of isolation, and increase access to a variety of social, emotional, and instrumental resources (Brannan & Bleistein, 2012). Additionally, since loneliness is a perception of inadequate access to social resources, novice TESOL professionals who experience loneliness may benefit from therapeutic activities that address the maladaptive cognitions that perpetuate feelings of loneliness (Masi, Chen, Hawkley, & Cacioppo, 2011). Lastly, these findings suggest that TESOL educational programs may be able to increase their students’ preparedness and overall resiliency to stress by informing them of the potential dangers of loneliness and adding loneliness reduction strategies to the curriculum.

References


Predicting the Cy Young Award Winner

Stephen Ockerman and Matthew Nabity

1. Introduction

The game of baseball has long been associated with collecting and analyzing empirical data. Since the creation of Major League Baseball in 1903, various numerical measurements have been recorded and invented.

These records have been used by fans of the game to assess teams and players, and more recently, by those interested in further studying the game. The mathematical study of baseball statistics is often referred to as sabermetrics, named after the Society for American Baseball Research (SABR) [3]. The practice of sabermetrics is depicted in the book Moneyball and in the recent movie adaptation. Mathematical analysis of the many facets of the game of baseball has been growing steadily in recent years.

In 2005, a mathematical model to predict the winner of MLB’s Cy Young Award was suggested by Sparks and Abrahamson [5]. This model used a different approach than the methodologies common to sabermetrics. The authors attempted to use on-field statistics to forecast off-field assessments. The Cy Young Award is awarded to the most outstanding pitcher in each of the American and National Leagues, and the winners are chosen by voting members of the Baseball Writers Association of America. The mathematical model was formulated not to predict who should be awarded the Cy Young Award but to accurately predict how the award voting would go. That is, the model hoped to use the current season of statistics to predict how voters would rank the pitchers.

Data from the 1993 season through the 2002 season was used, specifically five common statistics: wins, losses, earned run average, team winning percentage, and strikeouts. Weights for a weighted average were determined by formulating and solving a linear programming problem. A linear programming problem has a linear function of the unknowns. The objective is to maximize or minimize this function subject to constraints that are also linear. In this model, weights for each of the statistics were determined and then used to compute a numerical score for each player. The player with the highest score was expected to win the award, the player with the second highest score would finish in second place, and the player with the next highest score would finish in third place.

The model using all 20 seasons of data did not have a solution. After a closer inspection of the data, the authors removed the statistics from the American League (AL) in 1995. With this single constraint removed, the model correctly predicted the voters’ choice for the top three finishers in each league in every year except for the AL in 1995. In this isolated case, the winner was correctly identified, but second and third places were not.

Nearly a decade later, this work began with a central question, does this model accurately capture the attitude of the voters today? Those that follow the game of baseball may be aware of the numerous statistics available and the often intense debates about which ones matter more for in-season performance and post season accolades. Many baseball fans may also be aware of recent emphasis on statistics such as WHIP, walks and hits per inning pitched, or WAR, wins above replacement.

To explore the relevance of the model, we revisit the formulation of Sparks and Abrahamson’s model and apply it to more recent seasons, namely the 2005 through 2013 seasons. Based on
In the numerical results, we explore the addition of another statistic and suggest an updated version of the model. We report numerical results of our new model and discuss the results of our modeling efforts.

2. The Mathematical Model

When examining an award for pitchers, we need to understand the position. There are two major types of pitchers. The first, the starting pitcher, typically begins the game and pitches until relieved. The second, the relief pitcher, is any player that is not in the starting rotation. In recent years, the work of relief pitchers, specifically those that finish the game, has been increasingly appreciated by Cy Young voters. In fact, the National League (NL) Cy Young winner in 2003, Éric Gagné, was such a relief pitcher, often called a closer. Closers are usually judged by different standards than starting pitchers.

The model developed by Sparks and Abrahamson does not apply to the 2003 season in the NL as they restricted their analysis to include only starting pitchers. For the 2005 season, the model correctly predicted Chris Carpenter for the NL winner. In the AL that year, the consensus was that there was no stand out performance and many believed Mariano Rivera, a relief pitcher, would win. The mathematical model correctly predicted Bartolo Colón would be the AL winner, but Mariano Rivera, who finished second in the voting, was not included in the analysis as he was not a starting pitcher.

Other attempts to predict the Cy Young Award winner have been made using different mathematical techniques, for example the data mining approach by Smith et al [4]. Using a Bayesian classifier, the authors examined data from the years 1967 to 2006 and were more than 80% correct when restricting their analysis to only starting pitchers [4]. Accuracy suffered when including relief pitchers. Due to the difficult nature of including relief pitchers, the most successful models currently consider only starting pitchers.

The statistics used in the original model include wins (W), losses (L), earned run average (ERA), strikeouts (K) and team winning percentage (TWP). The first four of these measurements are fairly common, but TWP is not necessarily a direct assessment of an individual. One of the modeling assumptions is that players on better teams get more exposure and potentially more credit for the success of the team. To make the data easier to compare, Sparks and Abrahamson put all five statistics on the same scale, zero to ten, using simple linear transformations. The parameters were chosen so that a score near ten reflects a historic performance and a score near zero reflects a performance of little interest to voters. For pitcher \( i \) in year \( j \), they defined the following:

\[
p_{ij1} = \frac{W}{3} \quad (2.1)
\]
\[
p_{ij2} = 10 \left( \frac{15 - L}{15} \right) \quad (2.2)
\]
\[
p_{ij3} = 12.5 - 2.5(ERA) \quad (2.3)
\]
\[
p_{ij4} = 20(TWP - 0.25) \quad (2.4)
\]
\[
p_{ij5} = 10 \left( \frac{K - 50}{333} \right) \quad (2.5)
\]

Using the scaled data, a score for pitcher \( i \) in year \( j \), \( S_{ij} \), can be compute as weighted sum of these parameters:

\[
S_{ij} = \sum_{k=1}^{5} x_k p_{ijk},
\]

where the \( x_k \) are to be determined so that the pitcher that wins has the highest score in the league for year \( j \), the second-place finisher should have the second highest score, and the third-place finisher should have the third highest score.

Sparks and Abrahamson required that the nonnegative weights add up to one so that each score \( S_{ij} \) was a convex combination of the parameters \( p_{ijk} \), \( k = 1, 2, \ldots, 5 \). The formulation thus far is to find numbers \( x_1 \) through \( x_5 \) so that all of the following are true:

\[
\sum_{k=1}^{5} x_k = 1 \quad (2.6)
\]
\[
x_k \geq 0, \quad k = 1, \ldots, 5 \quad (2.7)
\]
\[
S_{1j} > S_{2j} > S_{3j}, \quad j = 1, \ldots, m, \quad (2.8)
\]
where \( m \) is the number of seasons used. The constraints 2.7 and 2.8 are close to the types of constraints that appear in a linear programming problem. A linear programming problem is characterized by linear functions of the unknowns and linear inequalities and equalities of the constraints [2]. The goal is to maximize or minimize a specific objective subject to certain constraints. For example, if \( p_1 \) and \( p_2 \) are two measures of performance described above, and the goal is to find weights \( w_1 \) and \( w_2 \) that would maximize the weighted average \( w_1 p_1 + w_2 p_2 \), then the overall problem could be expressed as

Maximize: \( w_1 p_1 + w_2 p_2 \)

Subject to:

\begin{align*}
p_1 + p_2 & \leq b \\
p_1 & \geq 0, p_2 \geq 0,
\end{align*}

where \( b \) is some number derived from the context. A successful solution to this simple linear program would compute values for \( w_1 \) and \( w_2 \). For details on linear programming problems and related algorithms, see [2]. Examining 2.8 more closely, we see that for each year \( j \)

\[ \sum_{k=1}^{5} x_k p_{1jk} > \sum_{k=1}^{5} x_k p_{2jk} > \sum_{k=1}^{5} x_k p_{3jk}, \]

or rearranging terms we have constraints of the form

\begin{align*}
\sum_{k=1}^{5} x_k (p_{1jk} - p_{2jk}) & > 0, j = 1, 2, \ldots, m, \\
\sum_{k=1}^{5} x_k (p_{2jk} - p_{3jk}) & > 0, j = 1, 2, \ldots, m. \quad (2.9)
\end{align*}

The authors made these inequalities not strict by replacing zero with a small positive number. This adjustment made it so that constraints 2.7 and 2.9 specify the feasible region for a linear programming problem. Mathematically speaking, all that was needed now was something to optimize, that is, an objective function.

Sparks and Abrahamson set up a linear programming problem in which the score \( S_{1j} \) for all years \( j \) in the data set was maximized. To accomplish this, they chose to maximize the sum of all winners over the years in the data set. In linear programming terms, this was selected as the objective function for the maximization problem. The final form of the problem was as follows:

**Problem (LP1-CY)**

Given \( a > 0 \), find \( x = (x_1, \ldots, x_5) \) that satisfies:

Maximize: \[ F(x) = \sum_{j=1}^{m} S_{1j} \]

subject to:

\begin{align*}
\sum_{k=1}^{5} x_k (p_{1jk} - p_{2jk}) & \geq a, \ j = 1, \ldots, m \\
\sum_{k=1}^{5} x_k (p_{2jk} - p_{3jk}) & \geq a, \ j = 1, \ldots, m \\
\sum_{k=1}^{5} x_k & = 1 \\
x_k & \geq 0, \ k = 1, \ldots, 5. \quad (2.14)
\end{align*}

We note that when using data from all 20 seasons, no feasible solution was found to exist. The 1995 season caused problems for the model LP1-CY and the authors chose to delete the AL information from that year. Removing this single constraint allowed the linear programming package from *Mathematica* to compute the following weights:

\begin{align*}
x_1 & = 0.578084, \quad \text{(W)} \\
x_2 & = 0.00999357, \quad \text{(L)} \\
x_3 & = 0.197600, \quad \text{(ERA)} \\
x_4 & = 0.0784757, \quad \text{(TWP)} \\
x_5 & = 0.136747, \quad \text{(K)}.
\end{align*}

These weights indicated that for the seasons under consideration, total wins was the most important category, followed by ERA and then by strikeouts. The assumption that TWP played a role was somewhat validated by the result that it was more important than total losses, which was practically irrelevant relative to the other components.
2.1. Numerical Results Part One

To explore the relevance of this model on more recent seasons, we performed a few numerical experiments. All computations were done using the linear programming capabilities of standard functions in MATLAB R 2013a. First, we used the original model formulation but only constraints from the past nine seasons, 2005 to 2013. As in the initial attempt by the original authors, no feasible solutions were found. Recall that the original authors had to remove a constraint, namely the 1995 season data from the AL. This may have been easy to identify as there was a players strike that ended the 1994 season and carried on into the 1995 season. When looking at more recent seasons, we had no obvious seasons to look at.

To gain some insight into the most recent nine seasons of data, we computed the scores for the top three finishers using the original weights computed by Sparks and Abrahamson for the data from 1993 through 2002. We found that the overall winner in the AL was correctly identified in six of the nine years: 2005, 2006, 2008, 2011, 2012, and 2013. Of these, the model did not properly account for relief pitcher Mariano Rivera in 2005, and had the second place and third place finishers in the wrong order in 2012. The story was about the same for the results in the NL. The model correctly identified the top three finishers in five of the nine years: 2005, 2006, 2007, 2010, and 2011.

Collectively, the weights determined by the LP1-CY were only successful in predicting the winners in both leagues in 2006 and 2011. We were unable to identify a pattern for the success or failure of the model, and there were no obvious seasons to consider removing from the set of constraints. Based on the assumption that the voters’ attitudes have been changing in recent years, we set out to incorporate additional information.

3. A New Model

Though there have been successful relief pitchers lately, we also opt to restrict our analysis to starting pitchers. Despite the fact that the weights computed by the original authors suggest that the number of losses seems unimportant to voters, we base our model on the five original statistics and choose to include an additional statistic. Walks plus hits per inning pitched (WHIP) is a sabermetric measurement that has been used to assess pitchers for over three decades. In recent years this statistic has found its way into MLB box scores on popular sports websites. The measurement attempts to measure a pitcher’s effectiveness against batters. The lowest single-season WHIP in MLB history, 0.7373, was recorded by Pedro Martinez during the 2000 season while playing for the Boston Red Sox [1]. Using this value as a historic performance, we define the transformation

\[ p_{ij6} = 10(2 - WHIP) - 2.627, \]  

(3.1)

to incorporate WHIP into the model based on LP1-CY. Here a WHIP of 0.7373 would score ten points. Adding this component to the data and using the scaled data from LP1-CY, we now consider the weighted sum or objective function

\[ S_{ij} = \sum_{k=1}^{6} x_k p_{ijk}, \]

where the \( x_k \) are to be determined so that the pitcher that wins again has the highest score. Reformulating this as a linear programming problem in the same manner as before, we have the follow-
Problem (LP2-CY)
Given \( a > 0 \), find \( x = (x_1, \ldots, x_6) \) that satisfies:

Maximize: 
\[
F(x) = \sum_{j=1}^{m} S_{ij} 
= \sum_{j=1}^{m} \sum_{k=1}^{6} x_k p_{1jk}
\]  
subject to:
\[
\sum_{k=1}^{6} x_k (p_{1jk} - p_{2jk}) \geq a, \ j = 1, \ldots, m 
\]  
\[
\sum_{k=1}^{6} x_k (p_{2jk} - p_{3jk}) \geq a, \ j = 1, \ldots, m 
\]  
\[
\sum_{k=1}^{6} x_k = 1 
\]  
\[
x_k \geq 0, \ k = 1, \ldots, 6. 
\]

The incorporation of an additional measurement changes both the objective function and the constraints that define the feasible region. We now seek six weights to help capture the voters’ attitude.

3.1. Numerical Results Part Two

In this section we report the results of further numerical experiments using both the original model LP1-CY and our updated version LP2-CY. Here we examine solutions to each of the models for various sets of constraints. The goal is to identify weights that most accurately predict the top three finishers.

We began with data from both leagues for the most recent seasons, 2005 through 2013. Recall from the previous numerical experiments, there was no feasible solution to LP1-CY using data from these nine seasons. We observed the same for our new model LP2-CY using these same constraints. To investigate this further, we turned to the original weights computed using the 1993 through 2002 seasons, excluding the AL results from 1995. Looking at the NL results using these weights, we noticed that there seemed to be a change after the 2007 season. This motivated us to restrict our constraints to data from the most recent six seasons.

Experiment 1

Here we used data from the past 6 seasons, 2008 through 2013, for both leagues. For LP1-CY, we computed the weights to be
\[
x_1 = 0.000000, \quad \text{(W)}
\]
\[
x_2 = 0.051184, \quad \text{(L)}
\]
\[
x_3 = 0.780348, \quad \text{(ERA)}
\]
\[
x_4 = 0.083859, \quad \text{(TWP)}
\]
\[
x_5 = 0.084608, \quad \text{(K)},
\]
and for LP2-CY we found the weights to be
\[
x_1 = 0.000000, \quad \text{(W)}
\]
\[
x_2 = 0.051184, \quad \text{(L)}
\]
\[
x_3 = 0.780348, \quad \text{(ERA)}
\]
\[
x_4 = 0.083859, \quad \text{(TWP)}
\]
\[
x_5 = 0.084608, \quad \text{(K)},
\]
\[
x_6 = 0.000000, \quad \text{(WHIP)}.
\]

We found the weights to be the same for either model as the weight for WHIP was determined to be \( x_6 = 0 \). Restricting our analysis to the seasons 2008 through 2013 seems to indicate that our new statistic may be extraneous. Here wins and WHIP do not seem to be factors, and ERA is the main component emphasized.

To assess the performance of these weights, we compute the numerical rankings for each of the top three finishers for both leagues. Table 3.1 shows the actual top three finishers in the AL and the scores computed by both models with incorrect predictions in red. We see that these weights were rather successful as all the top three finishers in the AL were correctly identified. Turning to the NL, we see quite a different story. Table 3.2 displays the actual top three finishers with the scores computed using weights identified by both models. Again, incorrect scores are highlighted in red. Here we see that the NL winner was only correctly
Table 3.1: AL Top Cy Young finishers and associated scores using weights from experiment 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>1st</th>
<th>2nd</th>
<th>3rd</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>'08</td>
<td>C. Lee 5.9328</td>
<td>R. Halladay 5.3351</td>
<td>F. Rodríguez 5.3341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'11</td>
<td>J. Verlander 6.4852</td>
<td>J. Weaver 6.1389</td>
<td>J. Shields 5.3232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'12</td>
<td>D. Price 6.0084</td>
<td>J. Verlander 5.8145</td>
<td>J. Weaver 5.3489</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'13</td>
<td>M. Scherzer 5.5325</td>
<td>Y. Darvish 5.5315</td>
<td>H. Iwakuma 5.5305</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.2: NL Top Cy Young Finishers and Associated Scores, experiment 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>1st</th>
<th>2nd</th>
<th>3rd</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>'08</td>
<td>T. Lincecum 5.8559</td>
<td>B. Webb 4.3567</td>
<td>J. Santana 5.9895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'09</td>
<td>T. Lincecum 6.2167</td>
<td>C. Carpenter 6.5219</td>
<td>A. Wainwright 5.7973</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'10</td>
<td>R. Halladay 6.1796</td>
<td>A. Wainwright 6.0552</td>
<td>U. Jiménez 5.2308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'11</td>
<td>C. Kershaw 5.5401</td>
<td>R. Halladay 6.5462</td>
<td>C. Lee 6.4261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'12</td>
<td>R. Dickey 7.3848</td>
<td>C. Kershaw 5.9495</td>
<td>G. González 5.3495</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'13</td>
<td>C. Kershaw 7.3848</td>
<td>A. Wainwright 5.2383</td>
<td>J. Fernandez 6.3602</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.3: AL Top Cy Young Finishers and Associated Scores, experiment 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>1st</th>
<th>2nd</th>
<th>3rd</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>'09</td>
<td>Z. Greinke 5.9801</td>
<td>F. Hernandez 5.9484</td>
<td>J. Verlander 5.9474</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'10</td>
<td>F. Hernandez 5.5639</td>
<td>D. Price 5.4816</td>
<td>C. Sabathia 5.7130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'11</td>
<td>J. Verlander 7.6206</td>
<td>J. Weaver 6.2056</td>
<td>J. Shields 5.8872</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'12</td>
<td>D. Price 6.1363</td>
<td>J. Verlander 6.1353</td>
<td>J. Weaver 6.1343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'13</td>
<td>M. Scherzer 7.0974</td>
<td>Y. Darvish 5.8543</td>
<td>H. Iwakuma 5.8089</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.2. We saw that these weights correctly identified all top three finishers in the AL but were much less successful in the NL, especially for the two most recent seasons as illustrated in Table 3.2.

Using LP2-CY with the constraints from the 2009 through 2013 seasons, we found the weights to be

\[
\begin{align*}
    x_1 &= 0.301385, \quad \text{(W)} \\
    x_2 &= 0.048033, \quad \text{(L)} \\
    x_3 &= 0.000000, \quad \text{(ERA)} \\
    x_4 &= 0.000000, \quad \text{(TWP)} \\
    x_5 &= 0.197455, \quad \text{(K)} \\
    x_6 &= 0.453127, \quad \text{(WHIP)}.
\end{align*}
\]

Now WHIP and wins are more important components, whereas both ERA and TWP are nonfactors. Using these weights, we compute the scores for the top three finishers in each league and compare the performance to the results in the first experiment. Table 3.3 shows the results for the AL using the weights computed by LP2-CY for the second experiment. Again, incorrect predictions are highlighted in red.

**Experiment 2**

We now restrict the constraints to data from the 2009 through 2013 seasons for both leagues. That is, we removed the statistics from the 2008 season. Using only the most recent five seasons, LP1-CY produced the same weights as in the first experiment. The scores for the top three finishers are they same as those reported in Table 3.1 and
season. If these scores are compared to the scores calculated in Table 3.3, we see that Max Scherzer had a higher score in Table 3.3. This suggests that the addition of WHIP may have been helpful for seasons such as this when players have comparable statistics.

Unfortunately, the weights computed by LP2-CY failed to correctly identify any of the finishers for the 2010 season. We will investigate this further in ensuing experiments. To fully assess the performance of our model we turn our attention to the NL results. Table 3.4 shows the scores for the top three NL finishers when using weights computed by LP2-CY and only data from the 2009 through 2013 season. Here we see a much different story than for the AL results.

We can look at Table 3.2 for the performance of LP1-CY in the second experiment as the computed weights remained the same. These weights correctly predicted the winner in only three of the five years, 2010, 2011, and 2013, and correctly identified all three finishers only in 2010 and 2011. For comparison, the weights computed by LP2-CY accurately captured all first place finishers over the years in question. The only incorrect score occurred in 2012 where second and third place were out of order. This is a significant improvement from the results in Table 3.2 and may offset the issue with the 2010 season in the AL. When examining the results from both leagues, it seems that for the seasons under consideration, LP2-CY more accurately predicts not only the winner but also the top three finishers.

### Additional Experiments

We performed several other experiments to attempt to identify problematic seasons. We found no feasible solutions to both LP1-CY and LP2-CY for the following sets of constraints: all data from 2005 through 2013, all data from 2005 through 2013 when omitting 2010 AL statistics, all data from 2005 through 2013 omitting all 2010 data, all data from 2005 to 2013 omitting 2010 AL statistics and 2012 NL statistics, all data from seasons 2005 through 2008, and all data from 2009 through 2013 omitting 2010 AL statistics.

We found two sets of constraints that generated two different sets of weights for LP2-CY when there was no feasible solution to LP1-CY. These configurations included the 2009 through 2013 seasons when omitting the 2010 AL data and the 2012 NL data and the 2009 through 2013 seasons when omitting the 2012 NL data. In either case, the weights switched the second place and third place finishers in the NL in 2012 as we saw in the second experiment in Table 3.4. The success of these other weights in the AL was not as good as what we observed in the second experiment in Table 3.3.

### 4. Discussion of Results

In this work, we examined the issue of predicting the Cy Young Award winner using regular season statistics and a decision model cast as a linear program. We applied an existing model, LP1-CY, to current seasons in an effort to see if the original statistics were enough to correctly predict the award winners. We found that when applied to recent seasons, the model forecast suffered. To investigate the addition of another statistic, we updated the model to include the sabermetric measurement WHIP. When restricted to data from seasons 2009 through 2013, the new model LP2-CY was much more successful in accurately predicting the top three finishers. Our model did have difficulty with the 2010 season in the AL and switched the second place and third place finishers in 2012. Having successfully made the case for the addition of

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>09</th>
<th>1st</th>
<th>2nd</th>
<th>3rd</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>T. Lincecum</td>
<td>6.142</td>
<td>C. Carpenter</td>
<td>5.9267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'10</td>
<td>R. Halladay</td>
<td>6.4270</td>
<td>A. Wainwright</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'12</td>
<td>R. Dickey</td>
<td>6.4655</td>
<td>C. Kershaw</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'13</td>
<td>C. Kershaw</td>
<td>6.6048</td>
<td>A. Wainwright</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.4: NL Top Cy Young Finishers and Associated Scores, experiment 2
WHIP, we plan to further investigate refinements to LP2-CY. A closer examination of individual seasons in both leagues may shed some light on problematic constraints or seasons. Additionally, the incorporation of additional sabermetric measurements may help better capture the voters’ behavior. We plan to investigate possible model improvements in time for the coming postseason.

References


"It'll Work Out:" Older Mothers' and Adult Daughters' Perspectives on Future Plans

Amy D. Ringer Western Oregon University
Jennifer Rice Western Oregon University
Nickie Sickles Western Oregon University
Erin Wilson Western Oregon University
Margaret M. Manoogian Western Oregon University
Faculty Sponsor: Dr. Margaret M. Manoogian

This qualitative study focused on types of support, relationship quality, and future care plans among 10 older mother-adult daughter dyads (N = 20). Guided by the life course perspective, the authors examined how mother-daughter relationships were renegotiated across the life course; focusing on the later stages of the life course when support exchanges and future care plans may be needed for older mothers. Emotional and instrumental supports were exchanged between all dyads regardless of relationship quality, with only emotionally close dyads exchanging financial support. The flow of support was predominantly downward, although it was more reciprocal in dyads with mothers in poor health. Most dyads had emotionally close relationships and had assumptions for future care, most often informal care; only 1 dyad had concrete plans. Results indicate that mothers may be reluctant to discuss future health constraints and daughters may be less inclined to consider future caregiving responsibilities. One potential outcome that may emerge is that the care that gets put into place is not the care that older mothers may have preferred. More resources are needed to help families discuss future support needs. Older women who are most likely to need care from adult children, typically daughters, may especially benefit from educational programs that include their family members.

Keywords: Intergenerational relationships, mothers, daughters, caregiving, future care plans, support exchanges

Anticipated future support of aging parents, when changes in their health may create a need for care, is a concern for many families. This care, typically provided by family members, is defined as informal support. Informal support within families may be emotional, such as providing a compassionate ear; instrumental, such as extending hands-on help (i.e., transportation and home maintenance); and financial, such as helping to pay for professional services (Connidis, 2010). These types of informal supports are individually negotiated in families, are bidirectional emanating from both adult children and older parents, and often are heightened when family members require assistance (Connidis, 2010; Sechrist, et al., 2012). Today, family members experience “shared lives” as intergenerational relationships now last longer than in previous times and intergenerational support can be more readily accessed in times of need (Bengtson, 2001, p. 5). Generally, older adults tend to live independently and offer a variety of support to their adult children, highlighting the typical flow of support that is offered from parents to children across the life course. However, once an older parent reaches a certain age, approximately 70 years, flow of support may change with adult children providing more to their aging parents (Sechrist, et al., 2012).

When older parents begin to experience health constraints in later life, families may choose to discuss formal care plans, deciding what types of supports may be needed if an older family member’s health is constrained or if end-of-life decisions are needed. The relationship between older mothers and their adult daughters are a critical context for exploration as to how formal care is discussed, negotiated, and operationalized in families. Older mothers and adult daughters consistently express strong emotional bonds and demonstrate higher dependence on the other for emotional and instrumental supports when compared to other family dyads, including fathers and sons (Connidis, 2010). Adult daughters are often the preferred source of support by both mothers and fathers (Sechrist, et al., 2012). Older mothers also are an important population to address when discussing future care needs. With increased marital disruptions and longer
lifespans than men, older women often are single, have adult children, and cope with chronic illnesses (Fingerman, et al., 2007). Simply, they depend more on the care of adult children while fathers are more likely to have spouses in place to provide care when and if needed (Connidis, 2010).

The purpose of this qualitative study was to explore how aging mothers and their adult daughters perceive and exchange support, as well as plan for future care needs of mothers. The life course perspective provides a framework for understanding the change and stability exhibited in mother-daughter relationships over time (Bengtson & Allen, 1993). This perspective links the experiences of earlier life to later life stages and of younger family members to older ones (Connidis, 2010). The life course perspective offers a dynamic view of how the family unit is shaped and relationships within the unit are negotiated through transitions and turning points (Luescher & Pillemer, 1998). Specifically, this model suggests that addressing the early and ongoing relationships between mothers and daughters and their patterns of support exchanges over time may illuminate future outcomes when typical patterns of support flows may change due to mothers’ health status.

In this study, we focused on this particular dyad, older mothers and daughters, because the gender of both parent and child influences support exchanges across the life course (Rossi & Rossi, 1990). We utilize the life course perspective as a pertinent framework for understanding how adult daughters and their mothers perceive and exchange support as a context for future care decisions for aging mothers. We also focused our study on dyadic perspectives as research suggests that these perspectives may differ in the context of family relationships (Sechrist, et al., 2012). The research questions for this study were as follows: (a) how do adult daughters and their older mothers perceive, offer, and receive support from each other?; (b) how does the quality and context of relationships influence current exchanges of support between adult daughters and their older mothers?; and (c) how does the quality and context of relationships influence future care plans?

**Exploring Formal Care Plans among Older Mothers and Adult Daughters**

This study focuses on how older mothers and their adult daughters exchange support and plan for the potential future care of aging mothers. Outlined below are the areas of research that are of importance to understand these dyadic perspectives including: social support exchanges, relationship quality, gender, and future care plans.

**Support exchanges between adult children and older parents.** Informal support for older adults frequently is provided by family members, friends, neighbors, or other people that are known by the individual; however, it is most frequently offered by daughters (Pillemer & Suitor, 2006). Such support ranges from emotional support to instrumental support (i.e., hands-on nursing care), yet is often the performance of light housework and errands (Connidis, 2010; Shapiro, 2004).

Intergenerational support flows from both older and younger generations with simultaneous and reciprocal exchanges occurring throughout the life course (Rossi & Rossi, 1990). These supports often are exchanged during normative transitions for both parents and children. Negative outcomes may occur when adult children need more support due to non-normative transitions such as divorce, loss of job, and return to school or when older parents experience non-normative transitions due to divorce (Sechrist, et al., 2012). Typically, support flows downward from parents to children, but changes do occur when parents experience health declines after 70 years of age (Sechrist, et al., 2012). It can be difficult to distinguish when parents need assistance because of variability in the areas of health, mobility, age, autonomy, and income (Stuifbergen, et al., 2010). Within the context of families, general feelings of filial responsibility, when an adult child provides care for parents because of the care provided to them as children (Connidis, 2010), often guides adult children to care for their aging parents (Swartz, 2009). A high correlation exists between the help given by parents and help given by children, thus implying a context of reciprocity (Rossi & Rossi, 1990).

**Relationship quality.** Relationship quality and emotional closeness influence the offer of support to older parents (Pillemer & Suitor, 2006; Stuifbergen, et al., 2010). Informal support is shaped by relationship quality, which is fueled by how one feels for another family member. There are themes related to more positive relationships such as generational continuity (identification with the mother-daughter relationship independent of societal change), closeness, emotional support, as well as family norms and values (Connidis, 2010).

The quality of intergenerational relationships between older parents and adult children exhibit diversity in levels of closeness, although most mother-daughter relationships are identified as close (Rossi & Rossi, 1990). These relationships, however, are dynamic across the life course and hold the potential for a myriad of feelings, including those that are considered ambivalent or more negative in nature. Ambivalence is defined as having subjective, simultaneous contradictory and opposing feelings and cognitions about a social situation or a personal relationship (Connidis & McMullin, 2002). For example, mothers and daughters may experience on-going tension and have conflicting views on a variety of issues (i.e. on parenting, marriage, dating, and childrearing) yet, may
also experience close feelings at the same time (i.e. sharing personal information and relying on each other) (Pillemer & Suitor, 2002). The presence of some ambivalence can be indicative of balanced realistic assessment about a given situation (Luescher & Pillemer, 1998). Regardless of whether or not a family member reports feelings of ambivalence, it has been shown that the occurrence is common (Sechrist, et al., 2012).

**Gender influences on intergenerational relationships.** Parents report that they are emotionally closer with adult daughters than with sons (Rossi & Rossi, 1990). Older parents suggest that daughters are more likely to hear disclosures of parental problems and provide care when parents are ill or disabled (Suitor & Pillemer, 2006). Support exchanges appear to be influenced by the gender of the older parent and the adult child (Lye, 1996; Marks & McLanahan, 1993; Rossi & Rossi, 1990). Similarity of gender is highly associated with caregiver preference in older parents (Pillemer & Suitor, 2006). As most single older adults are women, most caregivers are also women, regardless of choice. Women are expected to give care and enjoy doing so, even if they do not identify as a caregiving type, and social pressure limits individual agency regarding the choice to provide care (Connidis & McMullin, 2002).

Mothers and daughters are more likely to both provide, as well as receive support from each other, than fathers and sons (Sechrist, et al., 2012; Silverstein, et al., 2006). Mothers are more influenced by relationships, emotional closeness, and relationship history (Pillemer & Suitor, 2006). They may choose daughters to offer support to them if necessary because mothers and daughters have similar gendered life experiences and may better identify with each other (Suitor & Pillemer, 2006). Daughters also are more reactive to the needs of their parents than sons (Silverstein, et al., 2006). Conversely, daughters are more likely to rely on their mothers than their fathers for emotional support and advice, continuing the notion of reciprocity (Sechrist, et al., 2012).

**Future care plans.** Commonly, people discuss future care without making formal plans, due primarily to the notion that the older parent is not in need of care (Sorenson & Zarit, 1996). As Black et al. (2008) found in their study of family care plans for later life, many older adults claim to have plans (52.2%), yet only 1% have made formal plans. Formal care plans may not occur as older parents typically refrain from asking for support so as not to strain the relationship or burden their children, even if a need is present (Stuifbergen, et al., 2010). For older parents, this could occur in order to avoid marginalization of personal agency and free will (Funk, 2010; O’Connor, 2007).

Relationship quality appears to influence the choice of which adult child will provide care in the future. According to Pillemer & Suitor (2006), older mothers tend to prefer children with whom they have had a history of positive social support exchanges to be their caregivers. Additionally, when dyads experience “predictability and harmonious relations” (Suitor, Gilligan, & Pillemer, 2012, p. 395), older mothers experience more positive outcomes in the choice of who will provide care to them when needed.

Family members need to better prepare for potential health issues of aging parents. When formal care plans are not in place, negative consequences can occur. For instance, older adults who live alone and have greater disability tend to plan less for end-of-life care (Black, et al., 2008). Families that exhibit ineffective decision-making processes and communication patterns are less likely to engage in advanced care plans, which compound the potential of relational strain between older parents and adult children (Boerner, Carr, & Moorman, 2013). When no planning takes place, older parents tend to be dissatisfied with the amount of discussion they experience. Older parents want to talk about care when health constraints emerge, but these conversations seldom occur (Sorenson & Zarit, 1996). Not having plans in place also may have implications for not receiving the type of care that is desired or appropriate (Boerner, Carr, & Moorman, 2013).

**Method**

Data for this qualitative study were collected by undergraduate students in a class that focused on social ties and aging. Under the supervision of their professor, a family gerontologist and qualitative researcher, Institutional Review Board (IRB) approval was secured. Student researchers worked in pairs to conduct the interviews from February to March, 2013. A total of 10 adult daughter-older mother dyads (N = 20) were interviewed. Inclusion criteria for this study included: (a) older mothers who were minimum age of 60 years; (b) adult daughters who were minimum age of 40 years; (c) willingness to participate; (d) current residence in Oregon; and (e) available for in-person interviews.

**Sample**

The family dyads in this study were comprised of mothers (n = 10) who averaged 75.4 years of age (SD = 9.96) and daughters (n = 10) who averaged 46.75 years of age (SD = 9.22). Mothers were married (n = 5), divorced (n = 2), or widowed (n = 3); and reported an average annual income of $28,000. The number of adult children reported by older mothers ranged from 2 to 7, with an average of 3.4. Adult daughters were married (n = 4), divorced (n = 2) separated (n =1) or single (n = 3); averaged 1.6 children; and reported an average annual income of $44,000.
income of $33,250. All older mothers completed high school; 2 attended college and 1 had a graduate degree. All adult daughters completed high school; 6 attended college and 1 had an undergraduate degree.

Procedure
Using a convenience sample, the student research team recruited participants through social service providers and student social networks. Interviews were conducted either at homes or in mutually agreed upon sites. In order to ensure that participants were able to share their unique perspectives, interviews were conducted separately with adult daughters and their mothers. In the case of 1 dyad, an older mother was present during part of her adult daughter’s interview. The semi-structured protocol for the interviews focused on intergenerational relationship quality, intergenerational family transfers, perceptions of support, intergenerational family legacies, and anticipation of future care needs. Participants were not compensated for their time but were offered a copy of the completed study. Each interview was audiotaped and transcribed verbatim.

Data Analysis and Coding
A team of students who participated in the research process and their professor continued to meet and analyzed all interviews in this study. Research team members reviewed recordings and transcripts to ensure accuracy; subsequently, they read and discussed all transcripts. Pseudonyms were used for each dyad member.

At research meetings, the team developed a major coding scheme for this study as outlined by Berg (2008) that included social support, future plans, early and current relationship quality, proximity, and gender. Subsequently, 28 subcodes were identified within the 6 major coded areas. Identical subcodes were developed for mothers and daughters. Social support subcodes included: general, instrumental, financial, emotional, communication, and perceptions. Future plans subcodes included: future support exchanges and other references to the future. Early life and current relationship subcodes included: change of relationships over time, quality of relationships with other family members, and quality of relationships between older mothers and their daughters. Relationship quality between older mothers and their daughters were further coded into three categories: emotionally close, emotionally ambivalent, and emotionally distant. Mothers and daughters who described their relationships as “close,” “like best friends,” and/or other positive reports were determined as emotionally close. When mixed emotions were described within a dyad, the relationship quality was determined to be emotionally ambivalent. When limited emotional supports were exchanged within a dyad and participants described their relationships as “not close,” “distant,” and/or other negative descriptions were used, the relationship quality was coded as emotionally distant. Proximity was subcoded according to mothers’ and daughters’ geographic location relative to other family members. Finally, gender was subcoded according to mothers’ and daughters’ expectations and behaviors.

To increase interrater reliability, transcripts from two sets of interviews were coded by two student researchers. Any discrepancies were discussed by the larger research team and decisions were made as to distinct coding categories. After the interviews were coded, MAXqda qualitative software (http://www.maxqda.com) was used to assist in organizing the data by sorting codes across all interviews.

Results
Adult daughters and their mothers shared rich descriptions of their family experiences related to social support, relationship quality, and future care needs. The definitions as well as perceptions of the flow of support varied among mothers and their daughters but generally fell within emotional, instrumental, and financial categories. Mothers and adult daughters also described support exchanges that largely flowed from older mothers to adult daughters in relationships that typically were characterized as positive and close. In all the relationships represented in this study, mothers and daughters typically indicated that few conversations regarding future care needs had occurred.

Perceptions of Support among Mother-Daughter Dyads

Quite frequently, financial, emotional, and instrumental support were offered and received among dyads. It was uncommon for a participant to define support in only one of these domains. More commonly, a variety of supports flowed among these intergenerational pairs.

Financial support. When asked about the support that flowed between adult daughters and mothers, participants often referred to the receipt of financial assistance. Financial support was common with 7 adult daughters receiving financial assistance at some point in their adult lives. Of the adult daughters who received this financial support, only 2 were married; all others were single, divorced, or separated. Financial support typically flowed from the older to the younger generation, with most mothers either not needing or wanting financial help. Referring to her adult children, Phyllis explained, “I don’t want them to have to pay my bills. You know? I want to be able to take care of myself. I should be able to, since we have been living on social security now.” There was some tension evident among the majority of daughters who received financial support from their mothers, and it was
clear that daughters were only able to accept financial assistance with the understanding that they would repay it. Meg, an adult daughter, described her feelings:

I feel okay about it, as long as I can pay that help back, and usually that’s borrowing money (laughs). And she’s never, ever said no… she may grouse and grumble but she never says no. And I do always pay her back.

There also was a common belief that while the daughters might currently be receiving financial support, they would be able to reciprocate that support when it was needed. Diana described this reciprocity with her parents:

I don’t feel bad about it because I know I’m gonna be able to turn around and just pay em’ back. . . I know that when I get back… on my feet that I’d be able to do the same thing for them.

**Emotional support.** Emotional support was the most common type of support identified by our participants. To many participants, emotional support was defined as having another person to both listen to them and participate in shared activities. As Leslie shared, “It’s always nice to be able to, you know, bounce up here and see her and, you know, do stuff.” Another daughter, Heather, described her relationship with her mother as having “a shoulder to cry on” and having “somebody that’s there for me.” One mother, Betty, remarked, “I enjoy being able to talk to them [adult children] about certain things that, you know, they would understand and get their input on. I enjoy that.”

Every dyad described some form of emotional support being reciprocated; in some cases, emotional support was the only support dyads had to offer and in others, emotional support was barely visible. Heather shared, “I’d like to do more, but there’s not a lot to do for her because she’s pretty independent still. So, I mean she’s not that old.” She added that she and her mother contributed to their mutual happiness: “I think we all do that for each other a lot.”

Emotional support was perceived by many participants as far more important than any other type of support. Kris commented:

It seems kind of strange that, ya know, that’s how she helps me out, emotionally, and just knowing that she cares that much, that’s more than her coming over and doing any kind of manual labor, making dinner or whatever… that’s what means the most.

**Instrumental support.** Adult daughters and older mothers commonly exchanged instrumental support, with all dyads describing some form being offered and received. As defined by the participants, this support included direct assistance such as running errands, cooking, and cleaning. For instance, Meg said:

Well, my mother, she is legally blind. She doesn’t have to worry about how she’s gonna get to different places. She knows that I’m always gonna be here to do that for her. She doesn’t have to worry about cooking; I pretty much do all of that.

Health status was an important factor in who gave and received instrumental support. Phyllis acknowledged the potential shift in support that may take place in the future due to her health needs. She stated, referring to her adult children, “Oh, if I have it [resources] and they need it, there’s no problem. Nowadays, it’s probably going to work the other way around.” Betty described the influence of poor health on her ability to help her daughter.

Well, I love helping em’ [daughter’s family]. I mean that’s something I do enjoy doing… but my body has been so messed up lately that I haven’t really done a lot of them, and I go and babysit and that kind of thing and I take them out to dinner and stuff, so it isn’t like I’m doing their chores but… you know.

Another mother, Gladys, talked about how her daughter and other adult children helped her now that her health limited her ability to complete housework and other tasks. She explained:

Well, the one [adult daughter] who lives here helps me a lot in all kinds of ways. She’s decided to take over most of the cooking and does that. And actually most of the housework, what gets done. I’m just not physically able to do it anymore. And so she does most of that. The others, if I need help, they provide it. But I don’t ask for help very often.

For 2 mothers, health status appeared to be the primary deterrent to offers of instrumental support. In these cases, mothers received instrumental support from their daughters but were constrained in their ability to offer help to their daughters and their families.

Among the 10 dyads interviewed, we found that mothers and daughters overwhelmingly had congruent perceptions of both the support they offered and the support they received. While these perceptions were
similar, they were not always positive perceptions. Some dyads expressed that support was lacking or insufficient, but were in agreement that support was exchanged. Some felt that support in some areas was sufficient but that they would like other forms of support. Most commonly, dyads were in agreement about the type of support received and how it met their needs.

**Relationship Quality and Exchange of Support**

The quality of the adult daughter–older mother relationship shaped the type of support exchanged as well as how it was offered and received. Both adult daughters and older mothers generally spoke positively about the exchange of social support. Only 2 daughters in emotionally distant relationships shared less positive views about these support exchanges. One mother expressed dissatisfaction and wished to provide less support to her daughter. In general, however, it appeared that the expectations about how support should be exchanged at their respective ages, as well as the quality of the relationship over time shaped participants’ feelings about support.

Daughters with emotionally close relationships with their mothers spoke positively about the support they offered. Those with ambivalent or distant relationships were far more likely to provide support out of a sense of filial responsibility, the norm that adult children should help parents, and to feel negatively about these support exchanges. For instance, Jennifer explained:

> When my dad died and she needed wood, my boyfriend and I went and got her a load of wood. We’ve told her we’re there but she is, again... very much a person that will take advantage of any handouts offered. She’s pretty selfish and doesn’t really think through things, so I’ve told her that I would be there if something came up but at the same time, I know better than to put myself in a situation because I know she would take advantage of that.

Typically, mothers felt positively about the support they offered and received. Elizabeth offered a detailed explanation of the support given and received in her family:

> I don’t think anybody thinks about how it [support] makes you feel. You just do it because it needs doing and you’re just glad to help if you can, and if somebody couldn’t because they have some kind of conflict it’s like, okay, it’s not a big deal. It feels good to just know that you have the support. And anybody who’s ever really in a jam, you know if it was really, really serious, you just know that they’ve got your back. They’re going to drop whatever they’re doing and be there. So you feel good.

The quality of the adult daughter–older mother relationship was an important factor in the provision and receipt of financial support, with only dyads who described their relationships as emotionally close giving or receiving financial support. Dyads with ambivalent or distant relationships did not engage in financial support exchanges. Older mothers’ income levels were not as important a factor as the quality of their relationships with their daughters. As long as they had emotionally close relationships with their daughters, older mothers appeared willing to help financially as much as they could, even if their annual income was low.

**Motivations.** Generally, the motivations for providing support varied based on the relationship quality of individual dyads; motivations appeared to be congruent within each dyad. Both mothers and daughters acknowledged their emotionally close relationships as the context from which social support flowed. When a mother expressed that she was motivated to provide support due to her emotionally close relationship with her daughter, this was invariably what we found with her daughter as well. In dyads with emotionally ambivalent or distant relationships, filial responsibility was noted as the primary motivation for providing support by daughters. These dyads were also far more likely to provide primarily instrumental support, with limited emotional support and no financial support.

Dyads with emotionally close relationships were motivated to exchange a variety of supports, partly due to a long history of care and support offered by mothers. The emotional closeness these dyads shared allowed them to discern what type of support was currently needed and enabled them to provide necessary supports, as long as there was no health or financial constraints. Kris, a daughter, shared:

> We do have a really good relationship with our mom and... spend time with her, and vice versa. I am glad to do it for her. Like I said I’ll take a day off work, if you know, that works out best... I just see how much she does for me and what I do for her is minute.

In addition to emotional closeness, reciprocity was identified as a motivation for providing support. This was true for both mothers and daughters, although generational differences were evident in the description of reciprocal exchanges. From daughters’ descriptions, it was apparent that they wanted to reciprocate the care that had been, and continued to be, provided to them over their life course. Melissa shared, “I have no problem with it...
[providing support]. I mean, they have done so much for me, to help me over the years, that it’s my turn.” Mothers also described a desire to reciprocate the support daughters currently provided them, but this reciprocation appeared to stem from their generational position in the dyad and a long history of providing care to their daughters. Daughters were more likely to identify reciprocity as an important feature for the support they now offered mothers; however, it was very commonly identified among mothers as well. When mothers identified reciprocity as a motivator, they also described their relationship with their daughters as a friendship, as illustrated by Elizabeth when speaking of her adult children:

They are very good about help. If I needed something, they would be here. And I’d be there for them… Right now, because we’re both real adults, not like young adults or super-duper old adults, you know it feels like we’re almost peers in a way. It’s a mother-daughter relationship that is like a friend also.

As described previously, dyads with emotionally distant or ambivalent relationships were also motivated to exchange supports. In the absence of close emotional bonds, the support provided among these dyads was generally limited to instrumental tasks. Sometimes even this limited support was not exchanged. In the case of 1 dyad, both parties expressed that they were willing to provide instrumental support when needed and requested, but their strained relationship prevented offers of support.

Dyads with emotionally ambivalent or distant relationships were far more likely to identify a sense of filial responsibility as their primary motivation for providing support. In addition, some dyads expressed that receiving instrumental support helped to improve strained relationships. Mary, an older mother, shared, “I appreciate it [getting instrumental help] very much. Because that seems like that helps us get along better.”

**Future Care Plans for Older Mothers**

Interviews with both mothers and their adult daughters indicated a lack of conversations and planning for potential long-term care needs. Regardless of relationship quality, older mothers and adult daughters were not in communication with each other regarding future care. Past and current support exchanges were indicative of mothers’ and daughters’ confidence in future care being provided informally. Mothers from dyads with a history of reliable support exchanges over the life course were confident that care would be provided when needed. One mother from our sample with a history of poor support exchanges, however, lacked that confidence in her offspring and desired formal care when needed.

Mothers and adult daughters were asked if they had plans in place for when an older mother had an increased need for help with activities of daily living due to declining health. Most mothers did not have anything to report, although 8 mothers suggested that some type of discussion had occurred with their daughters and other family members. The majority of mothers believed that care would be provided informally by either the adult daughter or other children when they were unable to care for themselves. Three mothers said that they had been told by their children “not to worry,” that care would be provided to them. For each of these cases, there was not a consensus as to who would be providing the care, how care would be provided, or even at what point care would be provided. One mother, Gladys, illustrated the indirect assumptions made by families as to her future care:

My daughter and her husband had taken me out to lunch and coming back, we saw someone sleeping up under a bridge and I said I hope I never have to do that. And they both said you’ll never have to worry about that. The others have said things to the same effect, you know at different times. I never have had to worry about ever having a place to go or someone to take care of me if I needed it.

Two mothers reported that they would prefer formal support when support was needed. However, only 1 mother, Janet, the oldest mother in the study, had specific plans that she had shared with her daughter. Janet’s daughter, Leslie, explained:

She told me, you know, that if, if she couldn’t do stuff on her own that she wanted me... not for me to bring her into my own house and care for her. She wanted to go up to the health care center, and, or assisted living and live up there, and I said “Okay, we can do that.” You know, I mean, that’s her wishes and I’m gonna go with her wishes.

The overwhelming response from daughters was that future care plans had not been discussed with their mothers. However, they were certain that care would be provided by themselves, another sibling or, in some instances, multiple siblings. Again, a lack of discussion was evident among mothers and daughters as little was communicated about when that transition would take place, how care would be provided, and in most cases, who would be providing care. Only 2 daughters expressed that they would not want to be caregivers, although they did not state whether or not they would be willing to
provide other forms of support. In 1 dyad, Diana shared: “I don’t want to be a caregiver... In all honesty, I don’t see myself as even being able to do that.” When her mother, Phyllis, was asked if there were conversations about potential long-term care, her answer was “no.” A number of daughters stated that the topic was not allowed or was discouraged by their mothers.

Overall, only 1 dyad had intentionally discussed future care plans where both mother and daughter were knowledgeable of these plans, which included formal care. The majority had not had any intentional discussion of future care plans; some dyads had differing perceptions based on assumptions or remarks made by the other. Mary claimed that her daughter said she would build a mother-in-law apartment for her, while the daughter claimed future plans had not been discussed. Another mother, Suzanne, said that her children had expressed to her that she would receive care when needed, whereas her daughter said her mother “wouldn’t allow” talk of future care plans. Most often, there was an assumption within dyads that care would be provided by either the adult daughter or another sibling and sometimes these ideas were communicated in a light fashion or reflected a sense of shared humor. Denise, whose mother was present during part of the interview, glanced at her mother and stated, “Well, we always said we are not going to put you in a nursing home, we’ll shoot you beforehand...or duct tape or something, you know...we always said, we’ll take care of you.”

The decision about who would provide care was usually based on practicalities such as proximity. Adult children who lived nearby were viewed as more viable caregivers than those who lived far from mothers. One adult daughter assumed she would care for her mother when the need arises because she already lived with her and provided some care.

In 1 dyad, there had been a discussion between siblings about obligation for care and who would accept the responsibility when in fact the mother was planning on entering a long-term care facility when she required care. Jennifer shared:

My brother is very attached to that house and he had commented that he would do whatever he can to take care of her, as long as he’s getting the house, but realistically he’s not a care provider personality. I am very familiar with the caregiver responsibilities and... it’s rough, it’s rough when you absolutely love and respect the person that you’re taking care of, when you don’t... I don’t know. I’m really struggling with that because I have that obligation... and I know how important it is to my brother, but I don’t feel the desire to do

that for my mom so it’s kind of a struggle. Because I feel like I would do it to help my brother, but not necessarily to help my mother. I feel like she made her bed and she started the relationship on the path that it comes on and it’s not really fixed.

When interviewed, Ann stated that her plan was “not to have either one of them... so I will take care of myself until need be, and then I’ll put myself into a nursing facility. Whatever comes first.”

Many families were just confident that someone would step up in a time of need. As Elizabeth stated, “When the time comes, we’ll figure it out.” She elaborated:

I don’t really have any expectation for... I know that somebody, if I really needed the help, one of them is going to be there. I don’t know which kid it is, because it depends on circumstance. I’m not worried about it yet. And I don’t think any of them are overly worried about it or thinking about it yet either.

Meg, an adult daughter, illustrated her confidence in future care plans for her mother. She underscored, “No. She will stay home. She will always stay home.”

In general, few examples arose as to the identification of conversations regarding future care for mothers. While many older mothers were confident that their needs would be met, this was based on comments made in passing as opposed to conversations with the purpose of looking ahead at potential long-term care needs. As stated earlier, a history of reliable and positive support exchanges was found to be related to the degree of confidence mothers expressed in their future care.

Discussion

In our study, we identified three types of social support that were commonly exchanged among the adult daughters and their mothers: financial, emotional, and instrumental. Daughters were more likely to receive financial support than mothers, but instrumental and emotional supports were more reciprocal. Typically, perceptions of support offered and received among adult daughters and their mothers were similar. The quality of the relationship between mothers and their daughters influenced both the type of and motivation for social support exchanges. Projecting into the future, mothers and daughters were less likely to discuss any future care needs for mothers. Emotionally close dyads had the expectations that future care would be provided by their
family members but specific plans typically were not discussed.

Social Support and Relationship Quality

As expected, support flowed from older mothers to their daughters in this study as is often experienced between older parents and adult children across the life course except when parents have great need for financial resources and/or care (Sechrist, et al., 2012). Daughters often received financial assistance from the mothers in this study, reflective of daughters’ marital status and income level. Financial support, while appreciated by daughters, created both gratitude toward mothers but ambivalence when personal expectations were to be financially independent from mothers (Bengtson & Allen, 1993; Connidis, 2010). Mothers may continue to offer financial support even when their personal resources are limited because of their identity as a parent and possibly to ensure that care will be in place when their health declines. These issues need further exploration in future studies.

Emotional support was seen as the most important type of support and was the most frequently provided and received between dyads, suggesting emotional closeness among mothers and daughters across the life course (Pillemer & Suitor, 2006; Rossi & Rossi, 1990). Most of the dyads interviewed reported emotionally close relationships. Providing emotional support is often less time-consuming than providing instrumental support, usually less costly than providing financial support, and frequently offered with little effort in everyday interactions. For most dyads, it was simply the result of having a good relationship over the life course. A factor that influenced the emotional support offered and received was proximity: those that lived further apart communicated less often (Pillemer & Suitor, 2006).

Most older mothers and adult daughters identified ways that they exchanged instrumental support to each other. The specific needs of mothers and daughters reflected the type of instrumental supports that were exchanged. Some daughters offered little instrumental support to mothers, due to mothers’ independence and ability to provide self-care. Proximity also was an important factor in the provision of instrumental support. Some mothers expressed that they wished they lived closer so they could do more; some daughters expressed that they purposely remained nearby in order to provide support to their mothers (Silverstein, et al., 2006). One dyad lived together, facilitating smooth and frequent support exchanges between them.

Motivations for providing support were largely dependent on relationship quality among dyads. Adult daughters and older mothers who had emotionally close relationships were most often motivated by affection and reciprocity (Connidis, 2010; Stulbbergen, et al., 2010). Dyads with emotionally ambivalent or emotionally distant relationships were motivated by filial responsibility. The relationship quality of dyads also was a determining factor in how mothers and daughters felt about providing support: those with emotionally ambivalent or emotionally distant relationships had more negative feelings associated with support, whereas those with emotionally close relationships felt it was natural and regarded support positively. Health status and age influenced the social support offered and received in these dyads, with some mothers unable to offer instrumental support much or at all (Sechrist, et al., 2012). In these cases, mothers offered other types of support, adjusting to their aging process and health constraints.

Future Care Plans

Relationship quality also influenced the establishment of future care plans. When asked about future plans for support exchanges if mothers need care due to health constraints, a number of issues emerged: (a) future care plans largely were not discussed in long-term relationships marked by closeness and emotional support; (b) mothers and daughters were not always in agreement as to how future care would occur when mothers needed help; and (c) assumptions that future care would be provided were based on casual comments and relationship quality.

Mothers and daughters affirmed their intentions to continue to offer support in the future as a continued feature of their relationships up to this point in time. The life course perspective draws attention to the notion of linked lives over time (Bengtson & Allen, 1993) and these dyads were clear in their expectations to continue these exchanges as long as they had the ability. As these exchanges typically were offered within emotionally close relationships, there appeared to be no question that future care would be provided, even when those plans were not specifically discussed or negotiated. In fact, having an emotionally close relationship appeared to deter dyads from having distinct conversations about future care plans as there were assumptions made by mothers and daughters that care would be provided when needed.

Relationship quality between mothers and daughters may also influence the decision to seek formal care over informal care. One of the 2 dyads that preferred formal care had a very close, reciprocal relationship. The motivation for the mother to desire a future assisted living residence was that she had lived her life and felt her
daughter should be able to do the same without the burden of caregiving (Cahill, et al., 2009). Stemming from her identity as a mother, this mother’s comment suggested that her future choice of formal care in part allowed for her to express care and support regarding her daughter’s future. Dyads with emotionally ambivalent or emotionally distant relationships also may prefer formal care as opposed to depending on family members. This was the case with 1 dyad that had an emotionally distant relationship in which the older mother preferred formal care. This mother expressed her concerns about depending on her adult children when the relationship history between them had been strained.

Mothers and daughters in emotionally close dyads were not as likely to be in agreement regarding future care of mothers. This was illustrated by Mary, the older mother who assumed she would be living in a mother-in-law apartment on her daughter’s property, but her daughter reported no knowledge of future plans made with her mother. A common strategy emerged for older mothers and their daughters which translated into putting off discussions of future plans until mothers needed help with activities of daily living (Carr, et al., 2013). Most mothers voiced that they felt confident that one of their children would provide care when needed. It appeared that many mothers felt confident of this at least in part because of comments made in casual conversation with adult children, such as when Meg told her mother she would never have to worry about living under a bridge.

The lack of discussion of future care plans in these dyads may be related to mothers’ ages and their current health statuses. One exception, Janet, the oldest mother in this study, and her daughter, Leslie, were the only dyad to have a formal plan in place. This may reflect the increased risk for comorbidity of chronic diseases as mothers age. None of the dyads in which the mother was under 70 years of age had discussed future plans, which might indicate that future plans are not considered until mothers’ functionality begins to decline (Silverstein, et al., 2006).

**Implications for Future Research**

Our study of older mothers and their adult daughters had limitations. This study was conducted by students with varying levels of experience and expertise, who were learning how to probe for participant information. This being said, our qualitative study, although not generalizable to the general population, highlights some interesting avenues for future investigations. As suggested in other research (Carr, et al., 2013; Sorenson & Zarit, 1996), few discussions occur regarding formal care plans and end-of-life needs of older parents. This lack of formal care plans may have consequences for individual and family well-being. For instance, when future care plans are not verbalized, older mothers may be more vulnerable to poorer health outcomes by not having appropriate care when crises do occur.

The lack of clarity regarding future care plans between older mothers and their daughters as evidenced in this study may create tensions for mothers over time, even when they experience an emotionally close relationship with their adult daughters. From a life course perspective, both older mothers and their daughters may be reluctant to look at their future circumstances. Mothers may be hesitant to discuss future health constraints and daughters may be less inclined to consider future caregiving responsibilities (Pope, 2013). One potential outcome that may emerge is that the care that gets put into place is not the care that older mothers may have preferred. The results of this study suggest the importance of extending help to intergenerational pairs in order to help them specifically discuss their future care needs. This would be especially important for older mothers and their daughters as future care is most likely to be provided in the context of this relationship.

One interesting avenue for future qualitative and quantitative studies is the role of limited financial resources as a context for conversations regarding future care plans. As many dyads in this study had fewer financial resources, there may be a tendency to put off more formalized discussions about future care needs. Formal care may simply not be an option. Discussing the limits of family resources also may make these conversations more difficult.

**Conclusion**

This exploratory qualitative study was designed to gain a greater understanding of how older mothers and adult daughters perceive and exchange support and how relationship quality influences future care plans for mothers. The dyadic interviewing process was necessary in order to understand how future care may be understood and implemented from two different perspectives within the same family constellation. As the mother-daughter relationship typically is recognized as the strongest of family ties and is often relied upon for family care, our study underscored how future care plans are not discussed even among these dyads. Simply, older mothers are at risk for not receiving the care they desire or need when health declines. Our findings highlight a need within families and communities to make future care planning more of a priority to avoid negative outcomes for older women.

**References**


The Effects of Target Valence on Thought Suppression Efficacy
Tesalee K. Sensibaugh Western Oregon University
Faculty Sponsor: Dr. Joel Alexander

Thought suppression is a mental control strategy used in attempt to suppress unwanted thoughts. Unfortunately, it often causes a paradoxical increase in the frequency of such thoughts, both immediately (as an ‘initial enhancement effect’) and after thought suppression efforts have been ended (‘ironic rebound effect’). Research surrounding the role played by the valence of the relevant material on thought suppression efficacy has been limited. Despite this limitation, the current paper proposes to review the available thought suppression-valence literature and, from it, determine the role played by target valence on thought suppression efficacy and other suppression outcomes. Considered overall, the extant literature appears to suggest that target valence is not a major determinant of thought suppression outcomes, although further research is needed to confirm this theory.

Keywords: Thought suppression, valence, mental control strategies

Although it may seem to be an innocuous (albeit ineffective) mental control strategy, thought suppression has been linked to a wide variety of negative outcomes. Specifically, thought suppression appears to play a large role in the etiology and maintenance of many psychological conditions, especially those characterized by depression and/or anxiety (Iijima & Tanno, 2012). It is possible, for instance, that depressive rumination is facilitated by the ironic rebound effects that result from depressed individuals’ tendency to suppress negative thoughts (Erskine, Kvavilashvili, & Kornbrot, 2007; Lucian, 2009). The tendency to suppress unwanted thoughts has also been found to be predictive of self-injury and, more alarmingly, suicide attempts (Cukrowicz, Ekblad, Cheavens, Rosenthal, & Lynch, 2008; Najmi, Wegner, & Nock, 2007). Notably, the damaging effects are not exclusive to clinical populations. Research has repeatedly linked use of thought suppression to increased feelings of depression, anxiety, and general distress (Borton, Markowitz, & Dieterich, 2005; Kelly & Kahn, 1994; Marcks & Woods, 2005), negative thought processing biases (Beevers & Meyer, 2008), disruptions in immune function (Petrie, Booth, & Pennebaker, 1998), and decreases in state and long-term self-esteem (Borton, 2002; Borton & Casey, 2006; Borton et al, 2005) in both clinical and non-clinical samples.

While many studies have investigated the effects of thought suppression, the factors that affect thought suppression itself have received relatively little research attention. The role played by the valence (perceived positivity versus negativity) of the relevant material on suppression efficacy has been particularly neglected in this regard. A handful of related studies (e.g., McNally & Ricciardi, 1996; Roemer & Borkovec, 1994; Muris, Merckelbach, van den Hout, & de Jong, 1992) have been conducted, but have yielded mixed results, leaving the effects of valence unclear. Additionally, these studies have had a number of major design flaws that compromise the validity of their results, as will be discussed in later sections. Despite these problems, the current paper intends to integrate the results of past suppression-valence research into a model of thought suppression (the Input/Output Model of Thought Suppression) that accounts for the disparate findings. In particular, the current paper used the existing literature to explain how target valence influences thought suppression efficacy, which is described in terms of initial enhancement and ironic rebound effects.
Early Research

Although many earlier studies had investigated topics related to thought suppression (e.g., repression), thought suppression itself received minimal research attention prior to Wegner and colleagues’ (1987) initial ‘white bear’ study. In the now-classic study, participants were randomly assigned to either initially express (try to think about) or initially suppress (try not to think about) thoughts of a white bear. Participants then completed the other (expression or suppression) task. While performing these tasks, participants were to continuously verbalize their streams-of-thought (which were tape recorded) and ring a bell any time that they thought about a white bear. Frequency of target thoughts were measured for each task period by adding the number of times that the participant rang the bell with the number of times the participant mentioned white bears without ringing the bell. It was found that participants in both conditions were unsuccessful at suppressing white bear thoughts (suggesting an initial enhancement effect of thought suppression). Further, Wegner et al. (1987) observed that in the initial suppression group, the number of reported target thoughts increased significantly in the expression condition (suggesting an ironic rebound effect). Conspicuously, more target thoughts were reported in the post-suppression expression condition than in the initial expression condition.

Wegner et al.’s (1987) study sparked a wave of research interest on the topic of thought suppression. Although there had been very few (if any) studies on thought suppression before the 1987 study, several dozen were published in the years immediately after it. Interestingly, these studies have produced only mixed support for Wegner et al.’s (1987) original findings. The existence of an initial enhancement effect has been almost universally supported (Wenzlaff & Wegner, 2000), while research surrounding the ironic rebound effect has been much less definitive. A post-suppression rebound in target thoughts has been only occasionally observed (e.g., Geraets, Merckelbach, Jelicic, & Smeets, 2006; Wenzlaff, Wegner, & Klein, 1991); studies have just as frequently observed the opposite of an ironic rebound, a decrease in target thoughts post-suppression (e.g., Merckelbach, Muris, Van den Hout, & de Jong, 1991; Roemer, & Borkovec, 1994). Most of these studies have used either Wegner et al.’s (1987) original thought suppression paradigm or slightly modified versions of it, so it is unclear why the literature has produced such conflicting results, although some possible explanations are discussed in the following sections. The mixed results that characterize the general thought suppression literature also characterize the thought suppression-valence literature, as is also explored here.

Influence of Target Valence

A small handful of the studies released in the late-1980’s through mid-1990’s wave of thought suppression research investigated the effects of target valence—the perceived positivity versus negativity of the given thought suppression topic—on suppression outcomes (e.g., Howell & Conway, 1992; Kelly & Kahn, 1994; McNally & Ricciardi, 1996; Muris et al., 1992; Roemer & Borkovec, 1994). However, since the mid-1990’s the literature has largely focused on the negative effects of thought suppression and suppression’s role in various psychological disorders (e.g., Magee, Harden, & Teachman, 2012; Najmi & Wegner, 2008). Consequently, very few studies since the initial wave have focused directly on the influence of target valence on thought suppression efficacy. This is in spite of the fact that the role played by target valence is not well understood. The studies that have been conducted have produced mixed and often conflicting results, despite generally sharing the same basic methodological design (adapted from Wegner et al., 1987). A sample of such studies is described below and summarized in Table 1.

The most common finding in the literature appears to be that target valence does not influence the number of suppression failures. This finding is perhaps most directly supported by researchers McNally and Ricciardi (1996), who found no significant differences in numbers of suppression failures between emotional and neutral target groups. Other studies have supported the same general finding, but have also complicated it with various qualifications and secondary findings. Take the study of researchers Klein and Bratton (2007), who observed no difference in numbers of reported intrusions between personal negative, nonpersonal negative, and nonemotional valence groups in a thought suppression task. They also found that the groups differed in their response times (RT) for a post-suppression sentence verification task, with the nonemotional group having a faster RT than those in the nonpersonal negative and personal negative groups (although there was no significant difference between the nonpersonal and personal negative groups). On the basis of these results, Klein and Bratton suggest that emotional material (either personal or nonpersonal) and nonemotional material are suppressed equally effectively, but that suppression of emotional material is more cognitively taxing. Yet these results were contradicted by Muris et al. (1992), whose study suggested that neutral targets—but not emotional targets—produce an initial enhancement effect. Considered together, these studies suggest that target valence does not have any consistent effects on suppression success.
consciousness tasks' include any task in which participants must express their thoughts as they occur, and 'nonsuppression' tasks are those in which participants were to write a tally mark any time that they thought about the target.

Participants subsequently completed a sentence verification task for which their reaction time was measured.

Participants were read either an emotionally charged or neutral story (their thought suppression target). Participants completed both thought suppression and nonsuppression tasks, in randomly assigned order. Participants reported target thoughts by pressing a button.

Participants completed both thought suppression and nonsuppression tasks, in randomly assigned order. All tasks involved writing one's stream-of-consciousness.

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author (year)</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Target(s) and Target Valence(s)</th>
<th>Ironic Rebound</th>
<th>Valence Differences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Howell &amp; Conway</td>
<td>Participants assigned to positive and negative induced mood groups and to positive and negative target valence groups. All participants completed a verbal stream-of-consciousness thought suppression task (no other tasks included).</td>
<td>Neutral: nonemotional personal memory Negative: negative personal memory Negative: negative nonpersonal memory</td>
<td>No: initial expression &gt; post-suppression expression (opposite of ironic rebound)</td>
<td>No difference in suppression failures between valence groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kelly &amp; Kahn</td>
<td>Participants completed both thought suppression and expression tasks, in randomly assigned order. All tasks involved writing one's stream-of-consciousness and participants were to write a tally mark any time that they thought about the target.</td>
<td>Negative: most unpleasant frequently occurring thought Positive: most pleasant frequently occurring thought</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>No difference in suppression failures between valence groups Increase in reported thoughts following suppression (ironic rebound) approaching significance for negative target</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Klein &amp; Bratton</td>
<td>Participants completed a thought suppression task in which they were to record target thoughts by pressing a button. Participants subsequently completed a sentence verification task for which their reaction time was measured.</td>
<td>Neutral: white bear Negative: personally relevant negative thought</td>
<td>Mixed: decrease across conditions for neutral target group (opposite of ironic rebound), but increase across conditions for negative target group (ironic rebound) approaching significance</td>
<td>No difference in suppression failures between valence groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McNally &amp; Ricciardi</td>
<td>Participants completed both thought suppression and nonsuppression tasks, in randomly assigned order. All tasks involved verbalizing one's stream-of-consciousness.</td>
<td>Neutral: neutral story Negative: emotional (depressing) story</td>
<td>Mixed: observed for neutral group but not for emotional group</td>
<td>No difference in suppression failures between valence groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muris et al.</td>
<td>Participants were read either an emotionally-charged or neutral story (their thought suppression target). Participants completed both thought suppression and nonsuppression tasks, in randomly assigned order. Participants reported target thoughts by pressing a button.</td>
<td>Neutral: neutral imagined situation Negative: negative (anxious) imagined situation Negative: depressing memory</td>
<td>No: initial expression &gt; post-suppression (opposite of ironic rebound)</td>
<td>Ironic rebound observed for neutral target group but not for negative target group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roemer &amp; Borkovec</td>
<td>Participants either completed an initial suppression or initial expression task. All participants then completed a subsequent expression task. All tasks involved verbalizing one's stream-of-consciousness. Verbal statements were categorized as being directly related to the target, indirectly related to the target, or unrelated to the target.</td>
<td>Neutral: white bear</td>
<td>Yes: post-suppression expression &gt; initial expression</td>
<td>No difference in suppression failures between valence groups Suppression (number of directly related thoughts): no difference between valence groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wegner et al.</td>
<td>Participants completed both thought suppression and expression tasks, in randomly assigned order. All tasks involved verbalizing one's stream-of-consciousness and participants were to ring a bell any time that they thought about the target.</td>
<td>Neutral: white bear</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Increase in reported thoughts following suppression (ironic rebound) approaching significance for negative target</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. 'Initial enhancement effects'—increases in numbers of target thoughts during thought suppression compared to before thought suppression—were either observed or assumed to have occurred for all groups within all studies and so initial enhancement effects are not described here. 'Ironic rebound' is defined as an increase in number of target thoughts following a thought suppression task OR a greater number of target thoughts observed in post-suppression expression condition than in initial expression condition. ‘Suppression failures’ or ‘intrusions’ defined as number of target thoughts occurring during a thought suppression task. ‘Suppression’ tasks are those in which participants are instructed to try not to think about the target, 'expression' tasks are tasks in which participants are instructed to try to think about the target, and 'nonsuppression' tasks are those in which participants are not given any instruction about whether to think about the target or are told that they may think about anything. 'Stream-of-consciousness tasks' include any task in which participants must express their thoughts as they occur, either verbally or in writing. 'Ironic Rebound described in terms of number of reported target thoughts unless otherwise noted. 'Valence Differences described in terms of reported target thoughts unless otherwise noted.
Another complicating study was conducted by Roemer and Borkovec (1994), who found no significant difference between anxious, depressing, and neutral valence groups for suppression failures when ‘suppression failure’ was defined as the proportion of directly related statements reported during an initial suppression condition. Roemer and Borkovec also observed that anxious targets were associated with significantly more indirectly related statements during suppression than were neutral targets. This suggests that participants were able to suppress emotional and nonemotional material equally well in the sense of avoiding the target thoughts themselves, although the increase in indirect statements observed for anxious targets suggests that there was some effect of valence on suppression success.

Although it is a relatively common finding in the literature, not all studies report a statistically significant lack of effect of target valence on number of suppression intrusions. A study by Howell and Conway (1992) gave rise to the mood-congruency hypothesis of thought suppression, which suggests that mood-congruent thoughts are more difficult to suppress than are mood-incongruent thoughts. This is to say that when a person is in a depressive mood, sad thoughts are more difficult to suppress than non-sad thoughts; similarly, when one is in a cheerful mood, happy thoughts are more difficult to suppress than non-happy thoughts (and so on). In Howell and Conway’s study, target valence was shown to affect the number of suppression intrusions, although its effect was only evaluated as a function of mood. Accordingly, it is unclear what valence effects (if any) might have been observed in individuals in relatively neutral moods.

The inconsistent findings within the suppression-valence literature is perhaps most obvious in the lack of consensus regarding if (and how) valence influences the occurrence of an ironic rebound. For instance, Muris and colleagues (1992) did not observe an ironic rebound effect for either neutral or emotional groups and, similarly, Kelly and Kahn (1994) found that suppression of pleasant or unpleasant intrusive thoughts not only failed to produce an ironic rebound, but that it actually caused the opposite, a decrease in post-suppression thought frequency. These results suggest that valenced targets do not produce ironic rebounds and, in the case of Muris and colleagues’ (1992) work, that valenced targets produce similar thought suppression outcomes as nonvalenced targets.

By contrast, Roemer and Borkovec (1994), who differentiated between numbers of direct and indirect references to the target, observed that individuals with anxious or depressing targets exhibited a post-suppression rebound in the form of increased direct target-references, but that such an increase was not found for individuals with neutral targets. Such results are comparable to those of McNally and Ricciardi (1996), who found that individuals with a neutral target exhibited a post-suppression decrease in number of target-mentions (the opposite of a rebound effect), while those with a negative target showed a post-suppression increase (ironic rebound). The results of these studies, unlike those described earlier, suggest that valenced (specifically, negative) targets produce ironic rebounds and that these rebounds differentiate them from nonvalenced targets, which do not produce rebounds.

Overall, the thought suppression-valence literature has produced no definitive conclusions with respect to the influence of target valence on thought suppression efficacy. The reasons for this are unclear, but it is highly possible that the recurring design flaws and inconsistencies within past thought suppression-valence studies (described in the next section) have played a large role.

Limitations of Previous Research
The thought suppression literature—particularly that related to the effects of target valence—has been marked by major, recurring design flaws and methodological inconsistencies. In particular, studies have varied in the types of instructions they have provided for their nonsuppression conditions. Some have used ‘expression’-type instructions, in which participants are instructed to try to think of the target, while others have used ‘liberal’-type instructions, in which participants are told that they may think of anything, including the target. For example, if a study used ‘white bears’ as a thought suppression target, expression-type instructions might take the form of ‘try to think about white bears’ or ‘think about white bears as much as possible,’ while liberal-type instructions could take the form of ‘you may think about anything, including white bears.’ Expression- and liberal-type instructions have been shown to produce significantly different patterns of results (Merkelbach et al., 1991; Rassin, Muris, Jong, & de Bruin, 2005), which makes it difficult to compare results across studies that used different types of instructions. Fortunately, this problem appears to be leveling off, as the type of nonsuppression instructions researchers use has become increasingly consistent. In general, early research (including Wegner et al.’s [1987] original study) tended to use expression-type instructions, while more recent research (mid-1990s onward) has increasingly favored liberal-type instructions.

Another design flaw that has persisted in the literature is the use of a suppression-expression/expression-suppression design, which is to say a design using Wegner et al.’s (1987) original paradigm. In such studies, half of the participants complete a suppression task followed by an expression task, and half complete an
expression task followed by a suppression task. Studies using this design (e.g., Kelly & Kahn, 1994) have then compared numbers of expression task target-mentions between initial expression and initial suppression groups to evaluate whether an ironic rebound effect occurred. This is problematic, as it introduces the possibility for confounding practice effects. Individuals in the post-suppression expression group (i.e., the initial suppression group) will have had more experience with the thought-reporting task than those in the initial expression group and so might simply be better at reporting the target thoughts when they occur. To correct for this, more recent studies have generally tended to include a either an expressive- or liberal-type nonsuppression task that is completed by all participants following the initial expression/suppression conditions. Additionally, studies now tend to have participants complete a ‘practice’ thought-reporting session before moving on to the experimental tasks (Wenzlaff & Wegner, 2000).

Even more problematic for the thought suppression literature is the lack of consistency in the nature of the investigated targets. Studies ostensibly about general thought suppression vary greatly with respect to use of targets that are, to list a few examples, self-relevant or non-self-relevant, self-generated or provided, highly salient or non-salient, or primarily visual or verbal in nature. Unfortunately, the vast majority of past studies using more than one target have also mixed many of these mentioned variables between groups. Of particular note are studies investigating valence (e.g., McNally & Ricciardi, 1996; Nixon, Flood, & Jackson, 2007) that include a white bear target (which is presumably non-self-relevant, provided, and non-salient) as a neutral comparison condition alongside personally relevant thoughts or memories (which are presumably self-relevant, self-generated, and possibly salient). This inconsistency among thought suppression targets makes it unclear which variables account for any observed effects and so prevents definitive conclusions from being drawn from the thought suppression-valence literature. Accordingly, future research would benefit from use of more consistent thought suppression targets, both within and between individual studies.

In addition to the problems that affect the general thought suppression literature, the thought suppression-valence literature is plagued by its own set of problems. For example, a recurring issue is the common tendency for valence studies to leave out either neutral or positive valence conditions, with inclusion of positive conditions being particularly rare. Additionally, many studies that include a neutral condition use a white bear target, which introduces its own set of problems (e.g., the mentioned possible inconsistencies between targets). Similarly, another common issue is the variation in emotions associated with each valence direction (positive and negative). The targets in studies that include a negative valence condition have varied in whether they are associated with underlying feelings of sadness, anxiety, embarrassment, or any other negative emotion. This is particularly noteworthy considering that depressing- versus anxious-type negative targets have been shown to produce different patterns of results (Roemer & Borkovec, 1994). In any case, it seems likely that inconsistency in what constitutes a ‘positive’ or ‘negative’ target can account for much of the variability observed in the results of previous studies.

Discussion
When the results of the previous thought suppression-valence studies are considered together, it becomes clear that no definitive conclusions can be made about the effects of target valence on thought suppression efficacy. However, the overall pattern of results does provide support for two conflicting interpretations. The first possibility is that, due to the described methodological problems in the literature, a coherent understanding of the effects of target valence on thought suppression outcomes is simply not currently possible. By contrast, the second interpretation suggests that a major conclusion can be drawn from the available literature, but that it is negative—suggesting a lack of relationship between target valence and suppression outcomes—rather than the expected positive conclusion that some sort of relationship between the two exists (no matter how poorly understood said relationship would be).

According to the latter interpretation, the literature appears to suggest that target valence has very little (if any) effect on thought suppression outcomes. Importantly, this would explain both why the thought suppression-valence literature has been so limited and why the few studies that have been done in the area have produced such inconsistent results. If it is true that target valence has little to no effect on thought suppression outcomes, then thought suppression studies that focus on valence would tend to yield null results and so would also tend not to be published (as per the ‘file drawer effect’). Further, one could use this interpretation to make sense of the inconsistent pattern of results observed in the suppression-valence studies that still manage to find significance. Given that valence has little effect, one would assume that the results of these studies were actually driven by other, non-valence factors. As these factors would differ between the studies, this interpretation would explain the great inconsistency in their results. The problem with this interpretation is that it is not clear what these driving factors might be, although differences in methodology and target characteristics like those
described earlier (e.g., use of expression- versus liberal-type instructions, use of self-generated versus provided targets, etc.) likely play a large role. A visual depiction of an Input/Output Model of Thought Suppression is presented in Figure 1.

An advantage of the given Input/Output Model of Thought Suppression is that it lends itself to empirical testing. As an example, using the Input/Output Model of Thought Suppression for framework, a study could be designed to investigate whether the self-relevance of a thought suppression target mediates thought suppression’s effects on self-esteem. This could be tested by randomly assigning participants to self-relevant and non-self-relevant target groups and comparing their levels of self-esteem both before and after a thought suppression task.

To summarize, if one assumes that a coherent model of thought suppression can be derived from the available literature, target valence does not appear to be a major factor in determining thought suppression outcomes. Rather, it appears that these outcomes are primarily shaped by other forces, although it is not clear what these relevant forces are. Given that thought suppression is associated with a variety of damaging outcomes—including negative thought processing biases, decreases in self-esteem, and even the etiology and maintenance of various psychological disorders (Beevers & Meyer, 2008; Borton & Casey, 2006; Iijima & Tanno, 2012)—it is greatly important that the process and its influences be well understood. Thought suppression itself has received little research attention, however, and so the construct is currently not well described. Accordingly, it is recommended that future research be carried out on nonvalence potential determinants of thought suppression outcomes, as such research could ultimately allow the development of strategies to prevent or reverse thought suppression’s negative consequences. The use of a coherent model, such as the Input/Output Model of Thought Suppression proposed in this paper, could guide this further research.

References


